CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO 2022-23

Final Report and Recommendations

In accordance with Amended Ordinance No. 2022-25, the Charter Review Commission ("CRC") of University Heights, Ohio, submits and publishes the following Final Report and Recommendations regarding proposed amendments to the Charter of the City of University Heights, Ohio, and respectfully requests that Council vote to submit each such amendment to the electors of this City at the next general election to be held on November 7, 2023.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 01:

Gender-Neutrality

The CRC is recommending a Charter amendment that would replace gendered terms and language throughout the City's Charter with gender-neutral and gender-inclusive terms and language. This proposed amendment would correct the long-standing sexist, androcentric language of the Charter and replace it with language that communicates and promotes a more inclusive city and government. Our Charter should better recognize and reflect all residents and those people serving our community through our city government.

The proposed amendment would also replace Article 8, Section 11, of the Charter – which would be rendered superfluous by this proposed amendment – with a new provision granting Council the authority, by unanimous vote, to make non-substantive corrections and revisions to the Charter through the legislative process. This provision is modeled after provisions in the charters of the cities of Columbus and Kirtland. It would allow Council to make any future non-substantive revisions without having to resort to the burdensome and infrequently-used Charter amendment process under Article 8, Section 5, of the Charter. The difficulty of amending the Charter has allowed prejudicial language to remain in our Charter far too long. This proposed amendment would also allow Council to more easily correct minor errors and inconsistencies. For example, upon the recommendation of the previous Charter Review Commission in 2009, residents were asked to vote on a Charter amendment correcting certain grammatical and spelling errors in the Charter, including changing the word "insure" to "ensure" and the word "faxed" to "fixed." This proposed amendment would allow future Charter Review Commissions and voters to instead focus on substantive reforms to modernize and improve the organization, powers, functions, and procedures of local government to better serve the City's residents.

See generally Maria Mousmouti, Gender-Sensitive Law-Making: Concept and Process, 10 Theory & Prac. of Legis. 3 (2022), 223-233; Hannah Johnson, Legislating for Change: Gender-Sensitive Ex-Ante Legislative Scrutiny in Practice, 10 Theory & Prac. of Legis. 3 (2022), 249-269; American Psychological Association, Inclusive Language Guidelines (2021); Donald L. Revell & Jessica Vapnek, Gender-Silent Legislative Drafting in a Non-Binary World, 48 Cap. U. L. Rev. 2 (2020), 103-147; Margit Tavits & Efrén O. Pérez, Language Influences Mass Opinion Toward Gender and LGBT Equality, 116 PNAS 34 (2019), 16781-16786; Pat K. Chew & Lauren K. Kelley-Chew, Subtly Sexist Language, 16 Colum. J. Gender & L. 643 (2007), 643-678; Mary Jane Mossman, The Use of Non-Discriminatory Language in the Law, 73 Can. Bar Rev. 3 (1994), 347-371.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 02:

Eliminating Term Limits

The CRC is recommending an amendment to eliminate term limits for elected officers of University Heights. Currently, the Charter limits elected officials to serve no more than three consecutive four-year terms or fourteen consecutive years whether elected or appointed. This provision was approved by voters in 1995 when the movement in favor of term limits had reached its peak throughout the country. However, since the 1990s, term limits have proven to be detrimental – rather than beneficial – to good government.

Academic research shows that term limits increase the ideological polarization of legislatures, reduce legislators' expertise, capacity, and skills, weaken legislatures relative to executives, increase the influence of special interests and lobbyists, reduce voter turnout, and reduce productivity. See generally Karl Kurtz, State Legislative Term Limit Laws Turn 30, St. Legis. Mag. (Feb. 8, 2021); Casey Burgat, Brookings Inst., Five Reasons to Oppose Congressional Term Limits (Jan. 18, 2018); Michael P. Olson & Jon C. Rogowski, Legislative Term Limits and Polarization, 82 J. OF Pol. 2 (2019), 572-586; Jeff Cummins, The Effects of Legislative Term Limits on State Fiscal Conditions, 41 Am. Pol. Res. 3 (2012), 417-442; James Alt, et al., Disentangling Accountability and Competence in Elections: Evidence from U.S. Term Limits, 73 J. OF Pol. 1

(2011), 171-186; Patrick J. Egan, Term Limits for Municipal Elected Officials: Executive and Legislative Branches (2010); Adam J. McGlynn & Dari E. Sylvester, Assessing the Effects of Municipal Term Limits on Fiscal Policy in U.S. Cities, 42 St. & Loc. Gov. Rev. 2 (2010), 118-132; Kimberly Nalder, The Effect of State Legislative Term Limits on Voter Turnout, 7 St. Pol. & Pol'y Q. 2 (2007), 187-210; Institutional Change in American Politics: The Case of TERM LIMITS, EDS. KARL T. KURTZ, ET AL. (2007); Thad Kousser, The Limited Impact of Term Limits: Contingent Effects on the Complexity and Breadth of Laws, 6 St. Pol. & Pol'y Q. 4 (2006) 410-429; John M. Carey, et al., The Effects of Term Limits on State Legislatures: A New Survey of the 50 States, 31 LEGIS. STUD. Q. 1 (2006), 105-134; Marjorie Sarbaugh-Thompson, et al., Democracy among Strangers: Term Limits' Effect on the Relationship between State Legislators in Michigan, 6 St. Pol. & Pol'y Q 4 (2006), 384-409; Margaret SARBAUGH-THOMPSON, THE POLITICAL AND INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTS OF TERM LIMITS (2004); John C. Green, et al., Assessing Legislative Term Limits in Ohio (2002); Gary Moncrief & Joel A. Thompson, On the Outside Looking In: Lobbyists' Perspectives on the Effects of State Legislative Term Limits, 1 St. Pol. & POL'Y 4 (2001), 394-411.

The National Civic League's Model City Charter recommends against restricting the reelection of council members to subsequent terms. It comments:

Limiting reelection restricts the voters' opportunity to keep in office council members of whom they approve. Unlimited terms allow voters to provide a vote of confidence for council members who represent majority sentiment and a vote of opposition for members in the minority. Finally, the city benefits from the institutional memory of reelected council members.

Term limits are undemocratic. They restrict voter choice by barring candidates from the ballot. Voters should be able to vote freely to keep a strong elected official or remove an ineffective one. Experienced elected officials can have historical insights, leadership skills, and legislative expertise, which can benefit the City with ongoing and lasting positive effects beyond the current restricted terms. Term limits do not improve the functions of local government, and they cost us experienced and effective elected officials with extensive institutional and community knowledge. Voters should have the choice to keep the elected officials whom they want to represent them.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 03:

Law Director Appointment and Removal

The CRC is recommending an amendment to Article 6, Section 2, of the Charter concerning the appointment and removal of the City's Law Director. Currently, the Law Director is appointed by the Council and serves at the Council's pleasure. However, the Law Director's obligations extend beyond just those owed to the Council; the Law Director is the "legal advisor, attorney, and counselor for the City and all officers and departments thereof in matters relating to their official duties." See UH Ords. § 232.01.

This body has discussed the fact that the City's Law Director regularly counsels the Council and the Mayor in matters relating to their official duties. Since the Law Director has a fiduciary relationship with the Council and Mayor, this Commission recommends that the Mayor have the right to appoint the Law Director, subject to the approval of the Council. The Commission believes that this proposed format strikes an appropriate balance of power between the Mayor, who already possesses the power to appoint administrative officers, and the Council, which has the power to reject such appointment if it so desires.

Finally, the Commission recommends additional language which vests the power to remove the Law Director in the Mayor and the Council, upon a vote of the majority.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 04:

Decennial Charter Review

The Charter at present has no set date or procedure for charter review, and to date only three charter reviews have been approved by Council since the City's founding. It is common practice for cities to have a set period in which the charter is reviewed. Best practices are review between every five to ten years. Given the fast pace of change that takes place in society today and the need for local government to respond to that change, the CRC is recommending a mandatory review of the Charter every ten years.

See generally Columbus, OH, Charter, § 236; UH Amended Ord. 2022-25.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 05:

Department Name Modernization

The goal of this proposed amendment is to make the Charter consistent with the titles and department names as currently used by the City and to guarantee the place of Public Safety within the administration and fix its organization.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 06:

Ranked Choice Voting

The CRC is recommending an amendment providing for the election of the Mayor and members of Council by ranked choice voting (RCV). This proposed amendment would allow voters to rank up to six candidates in order of preference for an office or seat. The votes are first counted using every voter's first choice of candidate or candidates. If no candidate received enough first-choice votes to win an office or seat, the candidate with the fewest number of votes is eliminated, and the counting of votes then proceeds to another round. In the next round, if a voter's first choice of candidate has been eliminated, that voter's second choice of candidate is counted. The elimination process is repeated until each office or seat is filled. In our mayoral elections, RCV would serve as an instant runoff that would require a candidate to win a majority rather than plurality – of the vote to be elected. It would do so without the added cost of a low-turnout runoff election. RCV limits the problems of votesplitting, spoiler candidates, wasted votes, and strategic voting. It can better manage the problems that result from races with large fields of candidates. It is ideal for elections with multiple winners, like our Council elections. These are non-partisan democratic problems in need of a solution. RCV is used in 58 cities across the country. Many voters are often faced with the dilemma of holding their noises and voting for the most electable candidate whom they find the most acceptable rather than the candidate whom they truly prefer. RCV gives voters more meaningful choices and allows them to vote their consciences. It can lower barriers for candidates who are women or people of color. It can discourage negative campaigns because candidates must compete for secondchoice votes. It provides a fairer electoral process that can improve democratic legitimacy and civic participation and help elect City officials with broad support who more accurately represent voter preferences and the electorate.

See generally Chris Quinn, Op-Ed., Here's How You – Yes, You – Can Help Ohio and Cleveland Lead Our Polarized Nation Out of its Dysfunction, CLEVE-LAND.COM, (Feb. 25, 2023); Jo Ingles, What Is Ranked Choice Voting, and Should It Be Used in Ohio?, IDEASTREAM (April 12, 2022); Domenico Montanaro, Ranked-Choice Voting Gets a Prime-Time Shot Under New York City's Bright Lights, NPR (June 23, 2021); RANKED CHOICE VOTING RESOURCE CENTER, RANKED CHOICE VOTING STATE READINESS ASSESSMENT: OHIO (June 21, 2021); Amanda Zoch, National Conference of State Legislatures, The Rise of Ranked-Choice Voting, 28 LEGISBRIEF 34 (Sept. 2020).

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 07:

Recall Elections

The CRC is recommending a Charter amendment changing the process for recall elections so that the removal of an elected officer by recall election results in a vacancy. The proposed amendment is substantially in the form of Section 6.04 of the National Civic League's Model City Charter and would replace Article 4, Section 3, of the Charter in its entirety. The current process places an elected official who is subject to a certified recall petition on the ballot in a special recall election as a candidate for that same office along with any other nominated candidates. If the candidate receives a plurality of the vote in that recall election, the elected official is elected as their own successor to that office. Such a recall election procedure suffers from two potential democratic problems. If no other person is nominated as a candidate for the office in the recall election, the elected official will win by default and retain office. If multiple other people are nominated as candidates for the office in the recall election, it makes it more likely that the elected official will win a plurality of the vote when they otherwise would have lost a standard recall election asking voters to decide - yes or no - whether the elected officer should be removed from office. The proposed amendment would instead result in a vacancy upon a successful recall election, which would be filled under either Article 5, Section 3, for the Mayor or Article 3, Section 3, for a member of Council.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 08:

Initiative and Referendum

The CRC is recommending a Charter amendment that would reduce the number of signatures required on petitions for initiatives and referenda. This proposed amendment would amend Article 4, Sections 1 and 2, of the Charter to

make it easier for voters to propose any ordinance or resolution or to approve or reject any ordinance or resolution passed by Council. Due to the current overly burdensome signature requirements, these procedures are rarely used. The proposed amendment would reduce petition signature requirements by calculating them based on the total ballots cast in the City's last regular municipal election rather than the percentage of registered voters of the City. The number of registered voters of the City is significantly greater than the number of ballots cast in regular municipal elections. That is because voters may remain registered to vote even when they have moved or died and because voter turnout in local elections is regrettably significantly lower than elections held in even-numbered years. The City also contains John Carroll University, and university students' residency is often transitory. However, to balance the competing goals of encouraging responsive government through direct democracy and preventing the problems arising from an inundation of ballot initiatives, the proposed amendment also increases the percentages of signatures required so that the reduction in the number of required signatures would be less drastic than otherwise. Based on data on the City's 2021 regular municipal election, this amendment would reduce the signatures required to place an initiative or referendum on the ballot – without approval by Council – from approximately 890 to 669 signatures.

Nov. 2, 2021, Regular Municipal Election • University Heights, OH								
	Total	30%	25%	20%	15%	10%	5%	3%
Registered Voters	8,898	2,669	2,225	1,780	1,335	890	445	267
Ballots Cast	3,345	1,004	836	669	502	335	167	100

Source: Cuyahoga County Board of Elections, Amended Official Results by Precinct - Totals

Moreover, counsel to the CRC and the Cuyahoga County Board of Elections informed the CRC that the Ohio Supreme Court has invalidated petition requirements based on the total number of registered voters; otherwise, petitioners could not know the exact number of valid signatures required when circulating part-petitions because the percentage is not determined until the date the petition is filed and the number of registered voters may vary over time. See State ex rel. Huebner v. W. Jefferson Village Council, 75 Ohio St.3d 381, 384-85, 662 N.E.2d 339 (1995).

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 09:

Council's Presiding Officer

The CRC is recommending amendments to the Charter that relieve the Mayor of the obligation to preside at all meetings of the Council. The Commission recommends that the Vice Mayor preside at all meetings of the Council as the Council should have the responsibility of conducting its own meetings.

The CRC discussed the fact that the current structure invites conflict because the Mayor is not a member of the Council and may have interests that diverge from the Council's. The Mayor occupies an administrative and executive role under the City's Charter as opposed to the Council, which is a legislative body. To ensure that each branch of city government maintains some degree of independence from the other, this Commission recommends that Council take charge of its own meetings.

While the Commission recommends that the Vice Mayor preside at all meetings of the Council, the Commission also recommends that the Mayor and department directors be entitled to seats at Council's meetings so that executive branch officials may communicate their interests to Council.

In the event that voters should enact this proposed amendment, the CRC further recommends that the Council increase the Vice Mayor's compensation to reflect the Vice Mayor's increased duties and responsibilities under this new arrangement.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 10:

Anti-discrimination

This proposed amendment provides additional protections from discrimination by the City, especially for City employees, applicants, and hirees. The amendment acknowledges our ever-diversifying community and those who serve it. It supplements and provides a backstop to state and federal anti-discrimination protections. However, it does not take away the ability of the City to set standards and requirements that are reasonably necessary and substantially related to job duties and responsibilities.

Minority Report:

Hybrid At-Large and Ward Elections for Council

An amendment was also presented to the CRC for consideration that would have modified the City's current at-large electoral system for Council to a hybrid system consisting of three Council members elected at-large and four Council members elected from wards. However, by a vote of five to six, the proposed amendment failed. Proponents of the proposed amendment provide the following arguments in its favor:

The proposed amendment would have modified the current language in Article 2, Section 2, and Article 3, Section 1, and added a new Section 5 to Article 8 to institute an electoral system to address some of the issues with under-voting and develop a system with better communication, more diversity, increased awareness, and more residential engagement. Most cities with more than ten thousand residents operate either under a ward system or a hybrid system. Currently, the at-large system in place lacks direct lines of communication. Many people do not know whom to contact and do not have a go-to Council member. The proposed system would put a face in a neighborhood whom residents could directly contact with their concerns. Ward council members would have a geographic area to focus on, and they could become highly aware of the issues in their particular area, which in turn would move the entire city forward and make communication more efficient, increasing the probability of having more residential engagement in city matters socially, politically, environmentally, economically, and other situations/issues of that nature.

The National Civic League's Model City Charter recommends the use of districts or a combination of districts and at-large seats for city council elections to address diversity and representation issues. University Heights is not a homogenous community. It is diverse and has geographic concentrations of certain communities of interest — whether racial, ethnic, social, economic, or cultural — who are underrepresented as a result. A hybrid system would provide more fair and equitable representation on Council.

CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO

Stephen Wertheim, Chris Myrick, Wesley Kretch,
Chair Vice Chair Secretary
Margaret Duffy-Friedman David Farkas David Jackson
Threse Marshall H. Lee Crumrine Alicia Sloan
Tyler Bobes Jacquelyn Gould Rick Brown

SUBMITTED AND PUBLISHED MAY 31, 2023

CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO 2022-23

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 01

Purpose					
Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:					
An amendment replacing gendered terms and language throughout the Charter with gender-neutral and gender-inclusive terms and language and replacing Article 8, Section 11, with a provision granting Council with the authority to make non-substantive corrections and revisions to the Charter.					
Problem					
Brief description of the problem	m being addressed by the	proposal:			
This proposed amendment would correct the long-standing sexist, androcentric language of the Charter that has reflected the prejudices of society and replace it with language that communicates and promotes a more progressive and inclusive city and government. It will also grant Council the authority to make technical changes to the Charter without requiring an amendment so that similar revisions are easier to undertake in the future.					
Charter Provisions					
Charter provision(s) proposed	Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable:				
All; Art. 8, § 11					
Procedure and Vote					
Proponent(s): Crumrine					
Date of first discussion: October 25, 2022					
Date of second discussion: November 1, 2022					
Date of motion to adopt: November 1, 2022					
Movant: Crumrine					
Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Crumrine, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Gould, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan, Wertheim					
Vote result: [7] Yes [0] No [1] Abstain					
Roll call vote:					
Farkas □ Yes □ No ⊠ Abstain Go	ould ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain obes □ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Sloan \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Brown \square Yes \square No \square Abstain			

Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

Kretch \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

Duffy-Friedman \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Ab-

stain

CHARTER

* * *

ARTICLE 1. POWERS

* * *

SECTION 2. Qualifications of Officers. Each elective officers of the City shall be-a qualified electors of the City, shall have resided continuously therein not less than one year next preceding their his election, and shall continue to reside therein during their his term of office. He Officers shall hold no other elective public office during their his term, neither shall they he hold any other public employment incompatible with their his elective office in this City during such term, except as otherwise provided in this Charter, and further excepting the office of notary public and membership in the militia or reserve corps. The Council shall determine whether any public employment is incompatible with his elective office in this City.

No officers of this City, elective or otherwise, shall have any financial interest in any contract with or expenditure of money by this City other than their his fixed compensation and for expenses of travel as provided in Section 3 of Article 8. Such interest shall disqualify them him from holding office, in addition to the other penalties provided by law.

Every o Officers of this City shall, before assuming the duties of their his office, take and subscribe their his oath or affirmation to support the Constitution of the United States and the Constitution of Ohio and faithfully, honestly and impartially to discharge the duties of the office, and shall give such bond as may be required of them him conformably to this Charter.

Commencing January 1, 1996, without counting terms held prior to that date in such office, no person shall be eligible to hold the same elective office in the City for more than three (3) consecutive four (4) year elective terms or fourteen (14) consecutive years whether elected or appointed. "Consecutive" shall include time out of office for less than sixty (60) days.

SECTION 3. Removal of Officers. Any officer of this City shall be subject to removal in such manner as is now or may hereafter be provided by the general laws of Ohio, or by this Charter.

In addition, the Council may remove any officer of the City, including—<u>Councilmember Councilman</u>, for violation of any of the provisions of the next preceding section, or for failing or ceasing to possess any other qualification established by this Charter for <u>that his</u> office, or for the conviction while in office of any crime involving moral turpitude, but no such removal shall be made without the concurrence of at least five members of the Council nor until the accused officer shall have been given a written copy of the charges against him and an opportunity to be heard, with at least ten days notice of the time and place of hearing.

Absence of a <u>Councilman Councilmember</u> from five consecutive regular meetings of the Council, without such absence being authorized by an affirmative vote of four of the remaining members of the Council, shall operate to vacate such office of <u>Councilman Councilmember</u> forthwith.

ARTICLE 3. COUNCIL

* * *

SECTION 2. Organization. At the first Council meeting in January, but not later than the 7th day of January in the year 1958, and in January of each second year thereafter the Council shall meet in the Council Chamber and organize. At such organization meeting the Council shall elect by a majority vote one Councilmember Councilman, Vice-Mayor, and Councilmen members of boards and commissions required by this Charter or by ordinance, each to serve until the next organization meeting unless such Councilmember he shall cease in the meantime to be a member of the Councilcouncilman.

SECTION 3. Vacancy. Any vacancy in the Council, except as otherwise provided in this Charter, shall be filled by appointment by a majority vote of the remaining members of the Council. If the vacancy be not so filled within thirty (30) days, the Mayor shall fill it by appointment. Such appointee shall hold office for the unexpired term of the member in whose office the vacancy occurs or until a successor is elected and qualified.

A successor shall be elected at the next general municipal election if:

- 1. More than two (2) years remain in the unexpired term when the vacancy occurs; and if
- 2. The vacancy occurs more than seventy-five (75) days prior to such election.

At such election <u>each</u> candidates for Council, in <u>their his</u> declarations of candidacy and nominating petitions, shall designate the term of office to which <u>they he</u> seeks election by stating therein, if a full term, the date of commencement of said term as follows: "Full term commencing (DATE)" or by stating therein, if an unexpired term, the date on which it will end, as follows: "Unexpired term ending (DATE)". The terms of <u>no-Councilmembers councilman</u> shall <u>not</u> be lengthened by <u>his-their</u> resignation and subsequent appointment, but an appointee may be a candidate for subsequent election.

SECTION 4. Clerk of Council. The Council shall appoint a Clerk who shall be the Clerk of the Council and Secretary of the City Planning Commission, the Civil Service Commission, the Board of Zoning Appeals, and such other boards and commissions as the Council may establish by ordinance. He The Clerk shall give all notices of meetings, keep the records and minutes of the Council and of the boards and commissions of which the Clerk serves as he is secretary, authenticate all records, documents and instruments of the City on which authentication is proper, and for that purpose shall have and use a seal.

The Clerk shall examine warrants and disbursement checks approved by the Director of Finance and shall countersign checks in the manner provided by ordinance. The Clerk He shall perform all such other duties as the Council may require.

* * *

SECTION 7. Mayor's Veto. Every ordinance or resolution of the Council shall be signed by the Clerk or two members of the Council and presented to the Mayor forthwith for consideration before it goes into effect. The Mayor, if approving the ordinance or resolutionhe approves it, shall sign it and file it with the Clerk. The Mayor may approve or disapprove the whole or any item of an ordinance appropriating money, but otherwise that his approval or disapproval shall be addressed to the entire ordinance or resolution. The Mayor, if disapproving the ordinance or resolution If he disapproves it or any item of an ordinance it, he shall file it with written notice of the disapproval with the Clerk. Unless an ordinance or resolution is filed with the Clerk with written notice of disapproval, within seven days after its passage by the Council, it shall take effect as though the Mayor had signed it. When the Mayor has disapproved an ordinance or resolution or item of it, as herein provided, the Council may, at its next regular meeting thereafter, reconsider it and if upon such reconsideration the ordinance, resolution or item is approved by the votes of five or more

of the members of the Council, it shall take effect notwithstanding the disapproval of the Mayor.

ARTICLE 4. INITIATIVE, REFERENDUM AND RECALL

* * *

SECTION 3. Recall. The electors shall have the power to remove from office by recall election any elective officer of the City. At any time after an elective officer has held office for six months of the term for which he was chosen, a petition demanding his removal and the election of a successor to that in his office may be filed with the Clerk of the Council. Such petition shall comply with the provisions of Section 4 of this Article, and shall be signed by registered electors equal in number to at least twenty-five (25%) percent of the total number of voters casting ballots at the last preceding general municipal election. Within ten (10) days from the date of filing such petition, the Clerk shall determine the sufficiency thereof. If the Clerk shall find the petition insufficient, the Clerk he shall promptly certify the particulars in which the petition is defective and deliver a copy of the his certificate to the person who filed the petition with him, and such person shall be allowed twenty (20) days from the delivery of such copy of certificate in which to make the petition sufficient. If the Clerk shall find the petition sufficient the Clerk he shall promptly so certify to the Council and to the officer whose removal is sought, and, if the officer does not resign within five (5) days thereafter, the Council shall thereupon order and fix a day for holding a recall election, not less than thirty (30) nor more than forty (40) days from the date of the Clerk's certificate of sufficiency. At such recall election the name of the officer whose removal is sought shall be placed on the ballot as a candidate to succeed himself, unless that person he otherwise requests in writing at least twenty (20) days prior thereto, and the names of such other candidates for the same office shall be placed on the ballot as shall have been nominated in accordance with Article 2 Section 1 of this Charter at least twenty (20) days prior to such recall election. The recall election, except as it shall be limited to the offices from which a removal is sought, shall in other respects conform to the provisions of Article 2 Section 1 of this Charter. If at the recall election the incumbent does not receive a plurality of the votes cast, the candidate who does receive such a plurality shall be declared elected to succeed the incumbent for the remainder of their his term, and the incumbent shall be deemed removed from his office when such elected successor qualifies for the office or within ten (10) days after the recall election.

* * *

ARTICLE 5. THE MAYOR

* * *

SECTION 2. Term. The Mayor shall be elected at the regular municipal election in 1941 and every fourth year thereafter for a term of four years, commencing on the first day of January next after such election, and shall serve until <u>a his</u> successor is elected and qualified.

SECTION 3. Vacancy. When the Mayor is absent and inaccessible, or is unable for any cause to perform the his duties of that office, the Vice Mayor shall be acting Mayor, but shall not thereby cease to be a Councilmember councilman. In case of the Mayor's death, resignation or removal, other than by recall election, of the Mayor or disqualification his ceasing to qualify for the office, the Vice-Mayor shall vacate the his office of Councilmember councilman and shall become Mayor to serve the unexpired term or until a successor for the unexpired term is elected and qualified.

A successor shall be elected at the next regular municipal election provided that:

- 1. Such election occurs more than two (2) years prior to the expiration of the unexpired term; and
- 2. The vacancy occurs more than seventy-five (75) days prior to such election.

A Vice-Mayor, who has become Mayor, may be a candidate to succeed to the office for the unexpired term himself.

SECTION 4. General Powers and Duties.

- A. Judicial. The Mayor shall have all the judicial powers granted by the general laws of Ohio to mayors of cities, unless and until other lawful provisions shall be made for the exercise of such powers.
- B. Legislative. The Mayor shall preside at all meetings of the Council and shall have the power to veto as specified in Article 3 Section 7 of this Charter. The directors of all departments established by this Charter, or by ordinance, also shall be entitled to seats in the Council. Neither the Mayor nor any director of any department shall have a vote in the Council, but the Mayor shall have the right to introduce ordinances and to take part in the discussion of all

matters coming before the Council; and the directors of departments shall be entitled to take part in all discussions in the Council relating to their respective departments.

C. Executive. The Mayor shall be the chief executive officer of the City. He shall supervise the administration of the City's affairs, and shall exercise control over all departments and divisions except those reserved to Council or its officers and employees by this Charter. The Mayor He shall be the chief conservator of the peace within the City and shall see that all laws and ordinances are enforced therein. The Mayor He shall be responsible for the preparation and submission to the Council of the annual estimate of receipts and expenditures, and appropriation measure, and shall at all times keep the Council fully advised as to the financial condition and needs of the City. The Mayor He shall recommend to the Council such measures that are as he deems necessary or expedient. The Mayor He shall see that all terms and conditions imposed in favor of this City or its inhabitants in any franchise or contract to which this City is a party are faithfully kept and performed.

The Mayor shall appoint all officers and employees of the City, except members, officers and employees of the Council, judges, Clerk of Council and the Director of Law and their assistants. All persons appointed by the Mayor, except those whose terms of office are fixed by this Charter or by law, may be promoted, transferred, reduced or removed by the Mayor, subject however, to the Civil Service provisions of this Charter. The foregoing appointive powers of the Mayor may be delegated by the Mayor him to the directors of any department or to the heads of any divisions with respect to the officers or employees in the classified service within their respective departments or divisions.

The Mayor shall execute on behalf of the City all contracts, conveyances, evidences of indebtedness and all other instruments to which the City is a party.

The Mayor shall be recognized as the official and ceremonial head of the City government, by the governor for military purposes, and by the courts for the purpose of serving civil processes.

ARTICLE 6. ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS AND DEPARTMENTS

* * *

SECTION 2. Department of Law shall be in charge of the Director of Law, appointed by the Council to serve at the pleasure thereof. The Director of Law

shall be duly admitted to the practice of law in Ohio. The Director He shall be the city solicitor and shall perform all duties required by ordinance and the duties which are imposed upon city solicitors by the general law of Ohio.

SECTION 3. Department of Finance shall be headed by the Director of Finance, who shall be the fiscal officer and Treasurer of the City. He-The Director shall keep all the financial records and accounts of the City and an accurate account of all taxes and assessments, all assets and liabilities, all appropriations made by the Council, and all receipts and disbursements by the City. All payrolls, bills and other claims are subject to his-the Director's examination and approval. The Director He-shall issue warrants or checks for expenditures for which appropriations have been duly made and shall sign checks as Council shall require. The Director He-shall assist the Mayor and Council in the preparation of estimates, budgets and appropriations, and shall perform all the duties required by this Charter or by ordinance of Council.

The Director of Finance shall serve as the Treasurer of the City and shall be the collector and custodian of all monies of the City. The Director He shall keep and preserve them in such manner and in such places as the Council shall determine. The Director He shall receive and disburse all other public money coming into the city treasury his hands as Treasurer in pursuance of such regulations as may be prescribed by the authorities having lawful control over such funds.

There shall be in the Department of Public Safety a Division of Police, a Division of Fire, and a Division of Building Engineering and Inspection.

ARTICLE 7. COMMISSIONS AND BOARDS

* * *

SECTION 2. City Planning Commission. The City Planning Commission shall consist of the Mayor, one member of Council to be selected by the Council, and three electors of the City not holding other municipal office. The present members of the City Planning Commission, other than the Mayor and Councilman Councilmember, shall continue to serve until the expiration of their respective terms, and their successors shall each be appointed by the Mayor for a tern of four (4) years. A vacancy occurring during the term of any member of the City Planning Commission shall be filled for the unexpired term in the manner authorized for an original appointment.

The City Planning Commission shall have such powers as may be conferred on it by ordinance of the Council concerning the plan, design, location, removal, relocation and alteration of any public buildings or structures or those located on public streets or property; the location, relocation, widening, extension and vacation of streets, parkways, playgrounds and other public places, the approval of plats for the subdivision of land; the zoning and rezoning of the City for any lawful purpose and such other powers as are now or may hereafter be conferred upon it by ordinance of the Council or the general law of Ohio.

* * *

ARTICLE 8. MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS

* * *

SECTION 3. Salaries and Bonds. The Council shall fix the salary or compensation of all officers and employees of the City, and may require any officer or employee to give bond for the faithful performance of their his duties in such amount as it may determine and with such surety as it may approve, and may from time to time require additional bond or surety of any officer or employee, and may provide that the premium for any such bond be paid by the City.

Prior to the first day of November in 1959 and in each second year thereafter, the Council shall fix the compensation of the officers to be elected for the terms beginning on the next succeeding first day of January and the compensation of such officers shall not thereafter be changed for such term or any part thereof; except that for each absence of the Councilmember councilman from a regular meeting of the Council, unless authorized by the affirmative vote of at least four other members thereof, there shall be deducted a sum equal to two per cent (2%) of the annual salary of such Councilmember Councilman. Persons filling vacancies for the unexpired terms of elective officers shall receive the compensation theretofore fixed for such elective officers. The compensation of other officers and employees may be fixed and changed at any time in the discretion of the Council. All fees pertaining to any office shall be paid into the city treasury. The Council may authorize any officer or employee of the City to make such travel as the Council deems to be in the public interest, and may provide that the expense of such travel be paid by the City.

* * *

SECTION 11. Gender-neutrality and Charter Corrections. From the effective date of this amended section, the Charter shall be revised and corrected to be gender-neutral. In addition, Council shall have the authority to enact by ordinance, adopted by unanimous vote, typographical, grammatical, numerical or organizational sequencing, or other non-substantive revisions and corrections to this Charter, which shall be limited to spelling, grammar, punctuation, sentence construction, standardization of terminology, phrases, or references, and renumbering, reordering, or resequencing any sentences, paragraphs, or sections and shall not affect the substance, meaning, or purpose of any provision of this Charter. Construction. Masculine pronouns used in this Charter shall be construed to include the feminine pronoun, and the singular number shall be construed to include the plural number whenever the context shall require.

Except as a contrary intent appears herein, all acts of the Council of this municipality shall continue in effect until lawfully amended or repealed.

* * *

CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO 2022-23

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 02

Brief description of the purpose of the proposal: An amendment eliminating term limits for elected officers. Problem Brief description of the problem being addressed by the proposal: Term limits are undemocratic, and academic research shows that term limits increase the ideological polarization of legislatures, reduce legislators' expertise, capacity, and skills, weaken legislatures relative to executives, increase the influence of special interests and lobbyists, reduce voter turnout, reduce productivity, and fail to achieve their purported goals of good government. Charter Provisions Charter Provisions Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable: Art. 2, § 2. Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Roll call vote: Farkas ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Gould □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Jackson ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Stain	Purpose					
Brief description of the problem being addressed by the proposal: Term limits are undemocratic, and academic research shows that term limits increase the ideological polarization of legislatures, reduce legislators' expertise, capacity, and skills, weaken legislatures relative to executives, increase the influence of special interests and lobbyists, reduce voter turnout, reduce productivity, and fail to achieve their purported goals of good government. Charter Provisions Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable: Art. 2, § 2. Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas Ø Yes □ No □ Abstain Marshall □ Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick Ø Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick Ø Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim Ø Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman Ø Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman Ø Yes □ No □ Abstain	Brief description of the pur	Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:				
Brief description of the problem being addressed by the proposal: Term limits are undemocratic, and academic research shows that term limits increase the ideological polarization of legislatures, reduce legislators' expertise, capacity, and skills, weaken legislatures relative to executives, increase the influence of special interests and lobbyists, reduce voter turnout, reduce productivity, and fail to achieve their purported goals of good government. Charter Provisions Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable: Art. 2, § 2. Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas Ø Yes □ No □ Abstain	An amendment eliminating	g term limits for elected offic	cers.			
Term limits are undemocratic, and academic research shows that term limits increase the ideological polarization of legislatures, reduce legislators' expertise, capacity, and skills, weaken legislatures relative to executives, increase the influence of special interests and lobbyists, reduce voter turnout, reduce productivity, and fail to achieve their purported goals of good government. Charter Provisions Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable: Art. 2, § 2. Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Gould □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Jackson ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Marshall □ Yes □ No □ Abstain Bobes □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Problem					
crease the ideological polarization of legislatures, reduce legislators' expertise, capacity, and skills, weaken legislatures relative to executives, increase the influence of special interests and lobbyists, reduce voter turnout, reduce productivity, and fail to achieve their purported goals of good government. Charter Provisions Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable: Art. 2, § 2. Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Gould □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Jackson ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Marshall □ Yes □ No □ Abstain Bobes □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Jackson ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Stoan □ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Brief description of the pro-	blem being addressed by the	proposal:			
Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable: Art. 2, § 2. Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Gould □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Marshall □ Yes □ No □ Abstain Bobes □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	crease the ideological polarization of legislatures, reduce legislators' expertise, capacity, and skills, weaken legislatures relative to executives, increase the influence of special interests and lobbyists, reduce voter turnout, reduce productivity, and fail					
Art. 2, § 2. Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas \(\triangle Yes \(\triangle No \) Abstain Marshall \(\triangle Yes \(\triangle No \) Abstain Bobes \(\triangle Yes \(\triangle No \) Abstain Myrick \(\triangle Yes \(\triangle No \) Abstain Wertheim \(\triangle Yes \) No \(\triangle Abstain \) Duffy-Friedman \(\triangle Yes \) No \(\triangle Abstain \) Sloan \(\triangle Yes \) No \(\triangle Abstain \) Duffy-Friedman \(\triangle Yes \) No \(\triangle Abstain \) Stain	Charter Provisions					
Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Gould □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Jackson ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Marshall □ Yes □ No □ Abstain Bobes □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Charter provision(s) propos	sed to be deleted or amended	, if applicable:			
Procedure and Vote Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine Date of first discussion: January 18, 2023 Date of second discussion: January 24, 2023 Date of motion to adopt: January 24, 2023 Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Gould □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Jackson ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Marshall □ Yes □ No □ Abstain Bobes □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Art. 2, § 2.					
	Procedure and Vote					
	Proponent(s): Duffy-Friedn	nan, Crumrine				
Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Gould \square Yes \boxtimes No \square Abstain Sloan \square Yes \boxtimes No \square Abstain Marshall \square Yes \square No \square Abstain Bobes \square Yes \boxtimes No \square Abstain Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Duffy-Friedman \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Date of second discussion:	January 24, 2023				
Movant: Crumrine Second: Duffy-Friedman Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Gould \square Yes \boxtimes No \square Abstain Sloan \square Yes \boxtimes No \square Abstain Marshall \square Yes \square No \square Abstain Bobes \square Yes \boxtimes No \square Abstain Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Duffy-Friedman \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain						
Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick, Sloan Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote: Farkas \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Marshall \square Yes \square No \square Abstain Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Duffy-Friedman \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Movant: Crumrine					
	Commissioners present: Wertheim, Bobes, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Crumrine, Gould, Jackson, Kretch, Myrick,					
	Vote result: [7] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain					
Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain						
Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain stain	Marshall □ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Bobes □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain				
	Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	v			
$Kretch \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain$ $Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain$	Kretch ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	ain Crumrine ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain				

CHARTER

ARTICLE 2. NOMINATION, ELECTIONS, QUALIFICATIONS AND REMOVAL OF OFFICERS

* * *

SECTION 2. Qualifications of Officers. Each elective officer of the City shall be a qualified elector of the City, shall have resided continuously therein not less than one year next preceding his election, and shall continue to reside therein during his term of office. He shall hold no other elective public office during his term, neither shall he hold any other public employment incompatible with his elective office in this City during such term, except as otherwise provided in this Charter, and further excepting the office of notary public and membership in the militia or reserve corps. The Council shall determine whether any public employment is incompatible with his elective office in this City.

No officer of this City, elective or otherwise, shall have any financial interest in any contract with or expenditure of money by this City other than his fixed compensation and for expenses of travel as provided in Section 3 of Article 8. Such interest shall disqualify him from holding office, in addition to the other penalties provided by law.

Every officer of this City shall, before assuming the duties of his office, take and subscribe his oath or affirmation to support the Constitution of the United States and the Constitution of Ohio and faithfully, honestly and impartially to discharge the duties of the office, and shall give such bond as may be required of him conformably to this Charter.

Commencing January 1, 1996, without counting terms held prior to that date in such office, no person shall be eligible to hold the same elective office in the City for more than three (3) consecutive four (4) year elective terms or fourteen (14) consecutive years whether elected or appointed. "Consecutive" shall include time out of office for less than sixty (60) days.

CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO 2022-23

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 03

Purpose

Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:

The purpose of the proposal is to modify the method by which the City's Law Director is appointed.

Problem

Brief description of the problem being addressed by the proposal:

Article 6 of the City's Charter provides that the City's Law Director is appointed by Council to serve at the pleasure thereof. The City's Law Director is the legal advisor and counselor to the City and its officers and departments in connection with their official duties. Since the Law Director regularly counsels the Mayor and Council, the Mayor, as Chief Executive of the City, should appoint the City's Law Director subject to confirmation by Council. This format strikes an appropriate balance of power between the Council and the Mayor. By way of example, the City of Cleveland Heights and Cuyahoga County each require that the Mayor/Executive appoint a Director of Law subject to confirmation by the respective legislative bodies.

Charter Provisions

Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable:

Art. 6, § 2; Art. 5, § 4.

Procedure and Vote

Proponent(s): Kretch, Myrick

Date of first discussion: January 24, 2023

Date of second discussion: February 7, 2023

Date of motion to adopt: February 7, 2023 (Amended May 8, 2023)

Movant: Kretch

Second: Myrick

Commissioners present: Wertheim, Duffy-Friedman, Gould, Crumrine, Jackson, Kretch, Marshall, Myrick, Sloan

Vote result: [9] Yes [0] No [0] Abstain

Roll call vote:

Farkas □ Yes □ No □ Abstain

Marshall ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain

Bobes \square Yes \square No \square Abstain Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain

Gould \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

Sloan ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Ab-

Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

stain

Kretch ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain

Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

CHARTER

ARTICLE 5. THE MAYOR

* * *

SECTION 4. General Powers and Duties.

- A. Judicial. The Mayor shall have all the judicial powers granted by the general laws of Ohio to mayors of cities, unless and until other lawful provisions shall be made for the exercise of such powers.
- B. Legislative. The Mayor shall preside at all meetings of the Council and shall have the power to veto as specified in Article 3 Section 7 of this Charter. The directors of all departments established by this Charter, or by ordinance, also shall be entitled to seats in the Council. Neither the Mayor nor any director of any department shall have a vote in the Council, but the Mayor shall have the right to introduce ordinances and to take part in the discussion of all matters coming before the Council; and the directors of departments shall be entitled to take part in all discussions in the Council relating to their respective departments.
- C. Executive. The Mayor shall be the chief executive officer of the City. He shall supervise the administration of the City's affairs, and shall exercise control over all departments and divisions except those reserved to Council or its officers and employees by this Charter. He shall be the chief conservator of the peace within the City and shall see that all laws and ordinances are enforced therein. He shall be responsible for the preparation and submission to the Council of the annual estimate of receipts and expenditures, and appropriation measure, and shall at all times keep the Council fully advised as to the financial condition and needs of the City. He shall recommend to the Council such measures as he deems necessary or expedient. He shall see that all terms and conditions imposed in favor of this City or its inhabitants in any franchise or contract to which this City is a party are faithfully kept and performed.

The Mayor shall appoint all officers and employees of the City, except members, officers and employees of the Council, judges, Clerk of Council and the Director of Law and their assistants. The Law Director shall be appointed and removed as provided in Article 6, Section 2, of this Charter. All persons appointed by the Mayor, except those whose terms of office are fixed by this Charter or by law, may be promoted, transferred, reduced or removed by the Mayor,

subject however, to the Civil Service provisions of this Charter. The foregoing appointive powers of the Mayor may be delegated by him to the directors of any department or to the heads of any divisions with respect to the officers or employees in the classified service within their respective departments or divisions.

The Mayor shall execute on behalf of the City all contracts, conveyances, evidences of indebtedness and all other instruments to which the City is a party.

The Mayor shall be recognized as the official and ceremonial head of the City government, by the governor for military purposes, and by the courts for the purpose of serving civil processes.

* * *

ARTICLE 6. ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS AND DEPARTMENTS

* * *

SECTION 2. The Department of Law shall be directed by in charge of the Director of Law, appointed by the Mayor, subject to approval by a majority of the members of Council. Council to serve at the pleasure thereof. The Director of Law shall be duly admitted to the practice of law in Ohio. He shall be the city solicitor and shall perform all duties required by ordinance and the duties which are imposed upon city solicitors by the general law of Ohio. The Director of Law may be removed by either by the Mayor or by a majority of the members of Council.

CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO 2022-23

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 04

Purpose				
Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:				
An amendment providing f	or a decennial Charter Revi	ew Commission.		
Problem				
Brief description of the prob	blem being addressed by the	proposal:		
Council has established a C	Charter Review Commission	only three times since 1941:		
1979, 2008-09, and 2022-23	3. However, periodic compre	ehensive review of the City's		
Charter is necessary to mod	dernize and improve the orga	anization, powers, functions,		
·	ernment to better serve the	· •		
Charter Provisions		V		
Charter provision(s) propos	sed to be deleted or amended	, if applicable:		
Art. 7.				
Procedure and Vote				
Proponent(s): Wertheim				
Date of first discussion: Jan	nuary 18, 2023			
Date of second discussion: February 7, 2023				
Date of motion to adopt: February 7, 2023 (Amended May 2, 2023)				
Movant: Wertheim				
Second: Myrick				
Commissioners present: Wertheim, Duffy-Friedman, Gould, Crumrine, Jackson, Kretch, Marshall, Myrick, Sloan				
Vote result: [9] Yes [0] No [0] Abstain Roll call vote:				
Farkas □ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Gould ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Sloan ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain		
Marshall ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Bobes \square Yes \square No \square Abstain	Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain		
Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Wertheim ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain		
Kretch ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain			

CHARTER

ARTICLE 8. MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS

* * *

SECTION 5. Amendments. The Council may, by vote of at least five of its members, submit to the electors of the City of University Heights amendments to this Charter, and, upon petition signed by ten percent (10%) of the registered electors of this City setting forth any proposed amendment, such proposed amendment shall be so submitted by the Council. The submission of any proposed amendment to the electors shall be governed by the requirements of the Constitution of Ohio, and, to such extent as said Constitution shall fail to provide therefor, the Council shall determine the manner for such submission. If any such amendment is approved by a majority of the electors voting thereon, it shall become a part of this Charter; except that if two or more inconsistent amendments on the same subject are submitted at the same election, only the one of such amendments receiving the largest affirmative vote, nor less than a majority, shall become a part of this Charter.

Council shall, at least once during each ten-year period, by ordinance or resolution, appoint a Charter Review Commission to review the entire Charter. The first ten-year period shall end December 31, 2033. Thereafter each successive ten-year period shall commence on the date of Council's ordinance or resolution making such determination. The Mayor and Council shall, at their discretion, appoint a Commission of eleven (11) qualified electors of the City holding no other elected office in this City as members of the Charter Review Commission. The Mayor shall appoint four (4) of the Commission Members and Council shall appoint seven (7) of the Commission Members. Such Commission shall review the City Charter and not less than one hundred twenty (120) days prior to the general election in November of the succeeding year shall submit to Council any alterations, revisions or amendments of this Charter as in its judgment are recommended. The Council shall immediately review same and shall forthwith submit to the electors at the next general municipal election to be held in November, any such proposed alterations, revisions or amendments of this Charter which Council deems in its discretion to be advisable. The Members shall serve without compensation unless otherwise provided by Ordinance. All meetings of the Charter Review Commission shall be open to the <u>public.</u>

CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO 2022-23

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 05

Purpose				
Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:				
An amendment to update and modernize the names of administrative officers and departments and prohibit Council from eliminating the Division of Public Safety.				
Problem				
Brief description of the pro	blem being addressed by the	proposal:		
The Charter uses anachronistic terminology for administrative officers and departments that is inconsistent with the City's actual usage.				
Charter Provisions				
Charter provision(s) propo	sed to be deleted or amended	, if applicable:		
Art. 6.				
Procedure and Vote				
Proponent(s): Wertheim				
Date of first discussion: December 13, 2022				
Date of second discussion:	February 28, 2023			
Date of motion to adopt: I	February 28, 2023			
Movant: Wertheim				
Second: Myrick				
Commissioners present: Wertheim, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Gould, Crumrine, Jackson, Kretch, Marshall, Myrick, Sloan				
Vote result: [7] Yes [0] No [3] Abstai	n			
Roll call vote:				
Farkas □ Yes □ No ⊠ Abstain	Gould \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Sloan □ Yes □ No ⊠ Abstain		
Marshall □ Yes □ No 🗵 Abstain	Bobes \square Yes \square No \square Abstain	Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain		
Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain		
Kretch ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain			

CHARTER

ARTICLE 6. ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS AND DEPARTMENTS

SECTION 1. General Provisions. A <u>Law Department of Law</u>, a <u>Finance Department of Finance</u>, a <u>Department of Public Safety Division</u>, and a <u>Service Department of Public Service and Properties</u> are hereby established by this Charter, and the Council shall provide by ordinance for the organization thereof. The Council may establish by ordinance new departments or divisions thereof. With the exception of the Law and Finance Departments <u>and the Public Safety Division</u>, the Council may combine or abolish existing departments and divisions as it may deem necessary and may authorize one person to be the head of two or more departments or divisions.

SECTION 2. The Law Department of Law shall be in charge of the Law Director of Law, appointed by the Council to serve at the pleasure thereof. The Law Director of Law shall be duly admitted to the practice of law in Ohio. He shall be the city solicitor and shall perform all duties required by ordinance and the duties which are imposed upon city solicitors by the general law of Ohio.

SECTION 3. The Finance Department of Finance shall be headed by the Finance Director of Finance, who shall be the fiscal officer and Treasurer of the City. He shall keep all the financial records and accounts of the City and an accurate account of all taxes and assessments, all assets and liabilities, all appropriations made by the Council, and all receipts and disbursements by the City. All payrolls, bills and other claims are subject to his examination and approval. He shall issue warrants or checks for expenditures for which appropriations have been duly made and shall sign checks as Council shall require. He shall assist the Mayor and Council in the preparation of estimates, budgets and appropriations, and shall perform all the duties required by this Charter or by ordinance of Council.

The <u>Finance</u> Director of <u>Finance</u> shall serve as the Treasurer of the City and shall be the collector and custodian of all monies of the City. He shall keep and preserve them in such manner and in such places as the Council shall determine. He shall receive and disburse all other public money coming into his hands as Treasurer in pursuance of such regulations as may be prescribed by the authorities having lawful control over such funds.

There shall be in the Department of Public Safety Division a Division of Police Department, a Division of Fire Department, and a Building Department Vision of Building Engineering and Inspection.

CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION CITY OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS, OHIO 2022-23

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 06

Purpose	•
---------	---

Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:

An amendment providing for the election of the Mayor and members of Council by ranked choice voting.

Problem

Brief description of the problem being addressed by the proposal:

Ranked choice voting creates a more fair and representative election system that minimizes wasted votes, vote-splitting, and strategic voting, better reflects voter preference and the electorate, discourages negative campaigning as candidates compete for second-choice votes, would serve as an instant run-off election when a mayoral candidate only wins a plurality of the vote, may help elect more women and people of color, and is ideal for elections with multiple winners, like our Council elections.

Charter Provisions

Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable:

Art. 2, § 1.

Proce	dura	and	Voto

Proponent(s): Crumrine

Date of first discussion: February 7, 2023

Date of second discussion: February 28, 2023

Date of motion to adopt: February 28, 2023

Movant: Myrick

Second: Crumrine

Commissioners present: Bobes, Wertheim, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Gould, Crumrine, Jackson, Kretch, Marshall, Myrick, Sloan

Vote result: [8] Yes [3] No [0] Abstain

Roll call vote:

 $\mbox{Myrick} \boxtimes \mbox{Yes} \; \square \; \mbox{No} \; \square \; \mbox{Abstain} \qquad \qquad \mbox{Wertheim} \; \boxtimes \; \mbox{Yes} \; \square \; \mbox{No} \; \square \; \mbox{Abstain}$

Kretch \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

Sloan \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Duffy-Friedman \square Yes \boxtimes No \square Ab-

stain

CHARTER

ARTICLE 2. NOMINATION, ELECTIONS, QUALIFICATIONS AND REMOVAL OF OFFICERS

SECTION 1. Nominations and Elections. Nominations for elective officers of this City shall be made only by petition, signed by registered electors of the City not less in number than three percent (3%) of the number voting at the last regular municipal election and accompanied by the written acceptance of the nominee. The nomination of each candidate shall be made by separate petition and filed with the Board of Elections not later than 4:00 o'clock p.m. on the ninetieth (90th) (day prior to the date of election. No primary election shall be held for the selection of candidates for any elective office of the City. No nomination to any elective office of this City shall be of any effect unless made as required by this section.

SECTION 2. Elections. All officers of this City shall be elected by ranked choice voting as described in this section.

The design of the ballot and content of ballot instructions shall conform to the following requirements:

- 1. The ballot used in the election of officers of this City shall be without party mark or designation.
- 2. The names of all candidates for City office shall be placed upon the same ballot, and shall be rotated in the manner provided by the general law of Ohio.
- 3. The ballot shall allow a voter to rank candidates in order of choice for the office.
- 4. The ballot shall permit a voter to rank up to six candidates, inclusive of any write-in candidates permitted by law, in order of choice for the office, unless there are fewer than six candidates on the ballot for such office, in which case the ballot shall permit a voter to rank the total number of such candidates for such office, inclusive of any write-in candidate permitted by law.
- 5. The ballot shall, in plain language, set forth instructions that indicate how to mark a ballot and how to rank candidates in order of the voter's choice.

The Mayor shall be elected by single-winner ranked choice voting. Each ballot cast shall be initially counted as one vote for the candidate at its highest continuing ranking or as an exhausted ballot. If a candidate receives more than half of the total votes counting for candidates, that candidate is elected and the tabulation of votes is complete. Otherwise, the tabulation of votes shall proceed in successive rounds sequentially as follows:

- 1. The candidate with the fewest votes is defeated.
- 2. Votes for the defeated candidate shall cease counting for the defeated candidate and shall be added to the totals of each ballot's next-ranked continuing candidate or counted as exhausted ballots.
- 3. A new round begins.

Members of Council shall be elected by proportional ranked choice voting. Each ballot cast shall be initially counted as one vote for its highest-ranked continuing candidate or as an exhausted ballot. The election threshold shall be calculated, and the tabulation of votes shall proceed in successive rounds sequentially as follows:

- 1. If the number of continuing candidates whose vote totals exceed the election threshold is equal to the number of seats remaining to be filled, those candidates are elected and the tabulation of votes is complete. Otherwise, the tabulation of votes continues.
- 2. If the number of continuing candidates is equal to or less than the number of seats remaining to be filled, then all continuing candidates are elected and the tabulation of votes is complete. Otherwise, the tabulation of votes continues.
- 3. If at least one continuing candidate has a vote total that equals or exceeds the election threshold, then the continuing candidate with the highest vote total is elected. Otherwise, the tabulation of votes continues.
 - a. If a candidate is thus elected, the number of surplus votes and the surplus fraction for the elected candidate shall then be calculated.
 - b. Next, the new transfer value of each vote cast for the elected candidate shall be calculated.

- c. Votes for the elected candidate shall be added, at their new transfer values, to the totals of each ballot's highest-ranked continuing candidate or counted as exhausted ballots.
- d. A new round begins.
- 4. The candidate with the fewest votes is defeated.
 - a. If the number of continuing candidates is now equal to the number of seats remaining to be filled, all continuing candidates are elected, and the tabulation of votes is complete.
 - b. Otherwise, votes for the defeated candidate shall cease counting for the defeated candidate. Votes cast for the defeated candidate shall be added, at their current transfer values, to the totals of each ballot's next-ranked continuing candidate or counted as exhausted ballots, and a new round begins.

If a tie to determine which candidate has the greatest or fewest number of votes occurs at any point in the tabulation procedure and tabulation of votes cannot proceed until the tie is resolved, the chair of Board of Elections shall resolve the tie by lot in the presence of a majority of the members of the Board. For purposes of this section, the following terms are defined:

"Continuing candidate" means any candidate that has not been defeated or elected.

"Election threshold" means the number of votes sufficient for a candidate to be elected. The election threshold is equal to the total valid votes cast, divided by the sum of one plus the number of offices to be filled, and adding one to that quotient, disregarding any fractions.

"Exhausted ballot" means a ballot that can no longer be counted for any candidate for one or more of the following reasons:

- 1. It should count for its next-ranked continuing candidate, but it does not rank any more continuing candidates;
- 2. Its highest continuing ranking contains an overvote; or
- 3. It includes two or more skipped rankings prior to its highest continuing ranking.

"Highest continuing ranking" means the highest ranking for any continuing candidate.

"Overvote" means a voter has ranked more than one candidate at the same ranking.

"Ranked choice voting" means an election method in which voters rank candidates in order of choice and votes are tabulated by the procedures described in this section.

"Ranking" means the number assigned by a voter to a candidate to express the voter's preference for that candidate. A ranking of "1" is the highest ranking followed by "2" and then "3" and so on.

"Round" means a sequence of the process of voting tabulation beginning with Stage 1 as provided in this section.

"Skipped ranking" means a voter has left a ranking blank and ranks a candidate at a subsequent ranking.

"Surplus" means the difference between a candidate's vote total and the election threshold.

"Surplus fraction" means the number equal to a candidate's surplus divided by that candidate's vote total, calculated to four decimal places, ignoring any remainder.

"Transfer value" means the fraction of a vote that a ballot will contribute to its highest continuing ranking after a higher ranked candidate has been declared elected. The transfer value of a vote is calculated by multiplying the surplus fraction of the elected candidate by the vote's current value, calculated to four decimal places, ignoring any remainder.

Except as provided in this Charter, the general laws of Ohio shall govern the nomination and election of the elective officers of the City.

SECTION 32. Qualifications of Officers. Each elective officer of the City shall be a qualified elector of the City, shall have resided continuously therein not less than one year next preceding his election, and shall continue to reside therein during his term of office. He shall hold no other elective public office during his term, neither shall he hold any other public employment incompatible with his elective office in this City during such term, except as otherwise provided in this Charter, and further excepting the office of notary public and membership

in the militia or reserve corps. The Council shall determine whether any public employment is incompatible with his elective office in this City.

No officer of this City, elective or otherwise, shall have any financial interest in any contract with or expenditure of money by this City other than his fixed compensation and for expenses of travel as provided in Section 3 of Article 8. Such interest shall disqualify him from holding office, in addition to the other penalties provided by law.

Every officer of this City shall, before assuming the duties of his office, take and subscribe his oath or affirmation to support the Constitution of the United States and the Constitution of Ohio and faithfully, honestly and impartially to discharge the duties of the office, and shall give such bond as may be required of him conformably to this Charter.

Commencing January 1, 1996, without counting terms held prior to that date in such office, no person shall be eligible to hold the same elective office in the City for more than three (3) consecutive four (4) year elective terms or fourteen (14) consecutive years whether elected or appointed. "Consecutive" shall include time out of office for less than sixty (60) days.

SECTION <u>43</u>. Removal of Officers. Any officer of this City shall be subject to removal in such manner as is now or may hereafter be provided by the general laws of Ohio, or by this Charter.

In addition, the Council may remove any officer of the City, including Councilman, for violation of any of the provisions of the next preceding section, or for failing or ceasing to possess any other qualification established by this Charter for his office, or for the conviction while in office of any crime involving moral turpitude, but no such removal shall be made without the concurrence of at least five members of the Council nor until the accused officer shall have been given a written copy of the charges against him and an opportunity to be heard, with at least ten days notice of the time and place of hearing.

Absence of a Councilman from five consecutive regular meetings of the Council, without such absence being authorized by an affirmative vote of four of the remaining members of the Council, shall operate to vacate such office of Councilman forthwith.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 07

Purpose					
Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:					
An amendment replacing p	An amendment replacing provisions of the Charter regarding recall elections with				
provisions substantially in	provisions substantially in the form of Section 6.04 of the National Civic League				
Model City Charter.		_			
Problem					
Brief description of the problem being addressed by the proposal:					
This amendment would ch	ange the process of recall el	lections so that the recall or			
removal of an officer results in a vacancy.					
Charter Provisions					
Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable:					
Art. 4, § 3.					
Procedure and Vote					
Proponent(s): Crumrine					
Date of first discussion: February 28, 2023					
Date of second discussion: March 14, 2023					
Date of motion to adopt: March 14, 2023 (Amended April 18, 2023)					
Movant: Crumrine					
Second: Myrick					
Commissioners present: Wertheim, Frick, Sloan	arkas, Duffy-Friedman, Gould, Crumi	rine, Jackson, Kretch, Marshall, My-			
Vote result: [9] Yes [1] No [0] Abstair	n				
Roll call vote:					
Farkas □ Yes ⊠ No □ Abstain	Gould ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Sloan ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain			
Marshall ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Bobes \square Yes \square No \square Abstain	Jackson ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain			
Myrick ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain			
Kretch ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain	Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain				

ARTICLE 4. INITIATIVE, REFERENDUM AND RECALL

* * *

SECTION 3. Recall. The electors shall have the power to remove from office by recall election any elective officer of the City. At any time after an elective officer has held office for six months of the term for which he was chosen, a petition demanding his removal and the election of a successor in his office may be filed with the Clerk of the Council, Such petition shall comply with the provisions of Section 4 of this Article, and shall be signed by registered electors equal in number to at least twenty-five (25%) percent of the total number of voters casting ballots at the last preceding general municipal election. Within ten (10) days from the date of filing such petition, the Clerk shall determine the sufficiency thereof. If the Clerk shall find the petition insufficient, he shall promptly certify the particulars in which the petition is defective and deliver a copy of his certificate to the person who filed the petition with him, and such person shall be allowed twenty (20) days from the delivery of such copy of certificate in which to make the petition sufficient. If the Clerk shall find the petition sufficient he shall promptly so certify to the Council and to the officer whose removal is sought, and, if the officer does not resign within five (5) days thereafter, the Council shall thereupon order and fix a day for holding a recall election, not less than thirty (30) nor more than forty (40) days from the date of the Clerk's certificate of sufficiency. At such recall election the name of the officer whose removal is sought shall be placed on the ballot as a candidate to succeed himself, unless he otherwise requests in writing at least twenty (20) days prior thereto, and the names of such other candidates for the same office shall be placed on the ballot as shall have been nominated in accordance with Article 2 Section 1 of this Charter at least twenty (20) days prior to such recall election. The recall election, except as it shall be limited to the offices from which a removal is sought, shall in other respects conform to the provisions of Article 2 Section 1 of this Charter. If at the recall election the incumbent does not receive a plurality of the votes east, the candidate who does receive such a plurality shall be declared elected to succeed the incumbent for the remainder of his term, and the incumbent shall be deemed removed from his office when such elected successor qualifies for the office or within ten (10) days after the recall election.

The electors shall have the power to recall any elective officer of the City, but no recall petition shall be filed against any officer within six months after the officer takes office, nor in case of an officer subjected to a recall election and not removed, until at least six months after the election. Any five registered electors of the City may commence recall proceedings by filing with the Clerk of the Council an affidavit stating that they will constitute the petitioners' committee and be responsible for circulating the petition and filing it in proper form, stating their names and addresses, specifying the address to which all notices to the committee are to be sent, and stating the name and title of the officer sought to be recalled accompanied by a statement, not to exceed 200 words, of the reasons for the recall. Grounds for recall should relate to and affect the administration of the elective officer's office and be of a substantial nature directly affecting the rights and interest of the public. Promptly after receipt of a recall petition, the Clerk of Council shall serve, personally or by certified mail, a copy of the affidavit on the elective officer sought to be recalled. Within 10 days of service of the affidavit, the elective officer sought to be recalled may file a statement with the Clerk of Council, not to exceed 200 words, in response. Recall petitions must be signed by registered electors of the City equal in number to at least twenty-five percent of the total number of registered electors of the City to vote at the last regular municipal election. Recall petitions must be filed within 100 days of the filing of the petitioners' affidavit initiating the recall procedure. Within 20 days after the petition is filed, the Clerk of Council shall complete a certificate as to its sufficiency, specifying, if it is insufficient, the particulars wherein it is defective and shall promptly send a copy of the certificate to the petitioners' committee by registered mail. A petition certified insufficient for lack of the required number of valid signatures may be amended once if the petitioners' committee files a notice of intention to amend it with the Clerk of Council within two days after receiving the copy of his or her certificate and files a supplementary petition upon additional papers within 14 days after receiving the copy of such certificate. Such supplementary petition shall comply with the requirements of this section, and within five days after it is filed, the Clerk of Council shall complete a certificate as to the sufficiency of the petition as amended and promptly send a copy of such certificate to the petitioners' committee by registered mail as in the case of an original petition. If a petition or amended petition is certified sufficient, or if a petition or amended petition is certified insufficient and the petitioners' committee does not elect to amend or request Council review within the time reguired, the Clerk of Council shall promptly present his or her certificate to the

Council and the certificate shall then be a final determination as to the sufficiency of the petition. If a petition has been certified insufficient and the petitioners' committee does not file notice of intention to amend it or if an amended petition has been certified insufficient, the committee may, within two days after receiving the copy of such certificate, file a request that it be reviewed by Council. Council shall review the certificate or determination at its next meeting following the filing of such request, and Council's determination shall then be a final determination as to the sufficiency of the petition. A final determination as to the sufficiency of a petition shall be subject to court review. A final determination of insufficiency, even if sustained upon court review, shall not prejudice the filing of a new petition for the same purpose after the passage of one year from the date of the final determination of insufficiency. If a recall petition has been finally determined sufficient, it shall be submitted to the electors of the City. The recall election shall be held not less than 60 days and not later than 90 days from the date of the final determination. If no regular municipal election is to be held within the period prescribed in this subsection, Council shall provide for a special election; otherwise, the vote shall be held at the same time as such regular election, except that Council may in its discretion provide for a special election at an earlier date within the prescribed period. Ballots used at recall election shall read: "Shall [name of officer] be recalled (removed) from the office of [title of office]?" If a majority of registered electors vote in favor of the recall, the officer is removed and the seat is vacant, and the vacancy shall be filled in accordance with the applicable provisions of Article 3, Section 3, or Article 5, Section 3, of this Charter.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 08

${f Purpose}$	
---------------	--

Brief description of the purpose of the proposal:

An amendment changing the number of signatures required on petitions for an initiative or referendum from a percentage of registered voters of the City to a percentage of the total ballots cast in the City's last regular municipal election and adjusting such percentages.

Problem

Brief description of the problem being addressed by the proposal:

This amendment would make it easier for electors of the City to propose any ordinance or resolution or to approve or reject any ordinance or resolution passed by the Council.

Charter Provisions

Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable:

Art. 4, §§ 1 and 2.

Procedure and Vote

Proponent(s): Crumrine

Date of first discussion: February 28, 2023

Date of second discussion: March 14, 2023

Date of motion to adopt: March 14, 2023 (Amended April 18, 2023)

Movant: Crumrine

Second: Myrick

Commissioners present: Wertheim, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Gould, Crumrine, Jackson, Kretch, Marshall, Myrick, Sloan

Vote result: [9] Yes [1] No [0] Abstain

Kretch ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain

Roll call vote:

Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Crumrine \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Sloan \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain Duffy-Friedman \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain

ARTICLE 4. INITIATIVE, REFERENDUM AND RECALL

SECTION 1. Initiative. The electors of the City shall have power to propose any ordinance or resolution, except an ordinance for the appropriation of money or an ordinance making a tax levy, and to adopt or reject the same at the polls, such power being known as the initiative. An initiated ordinance or resolution may be submitted to the Clerk of the Council by petition signed by registered electors of the City equal in number to at least ten five percent (105%) of the total number of voters casting ballots at the last regular municipal election. registered electors of the City, When so submitted, the Clerk shall forthwith determine the sufficiency of the petition and if found sufficient, the Council shall at once have the proposed ordinance or resolution read and referred to an appropriate committee which may be a committee of the whole. Provision shall be made for public hearings on the proposed ordinance or resolution not later than thirty (30) days after the date on which such ordinance or resolution was submitted to the Clerk. The Council shall within forty (40) days after such ordinance or resolution is submitted, take final action thereon, either enacting or rejecting the proposed ordinance or resolution. If the Council fails or refuses to pass such proposed ordinance or resolution or passes it in some form different from that set forth in the petition therefor, the committee of the petitioners may require that it be submitted to a vote of the electors either in its original form or in the amended form by filing with the Clerk a supplemental petition signed by that number of additional registered electors which, when taken together with those who signed the original petition, will total at least twenty ten-percent (210%) of the total number of voters casting ballots at the last regular municipal electionthe registered electors of the City, and if said supplemental petition is signed by that number of additional registered electors which, when taken together with those who signed the original petition, will total at least twenty-five percent (250%) of the total number of voters casting ballots at the last regular municipal election registered electors the date of the election may be fixed therein, not less than ninety sixty (690) days from the time of filing such supplemental petition. Such supplemental petition shall be filed within ten (10) days after the final action on such ordinance or resolution by the Council. The Council shall thereupon provide, for submitting such ordinance or resolution to the vote of the electors at the date so fixed, or at the next general election in any year occurring more than ninety sixty (690) days from the filing of such supplemental petition, if no date be so fixed therein.

SECTION 2. Referendum. The electors shall have the power to approve or reject at the polls any ordinance or resolution passed by the Council, except as hereinafter provided. Within thirty (30) days after the final passage by the Council of an ordinance or resolution, a petition signed by registered electors of the City equal in number to at least twenty ten percent (240%) of the total number of voters casting ballots at the last regular municipal election registered electors of the City may be filed with the Clerk of the Council, requesting that such ordinance or resolution be either repealed or submitted to a vote of the electors. If said petition is signed by registered electors of the City equal in number to twenty-five percent (250%)- of the total number of voters casting ballots at the last regular municipal electionor more of such registered electors, the date of the election may be fixed therein, not less than ninety (90) days from the time of filing thereof. When such petition is filed, the Clerk shall first ascertain the sufficiency of the petition, and if found sufficient, the Council shall thereupon, within thirty (30) days of the filing of such petition, reconsider such ordinance or resolution. If upon such reconsideration the ordinance or resolution is not repealed, the Council shall provide for submitting it to a vote of the electors on the date so fixed, or at the first general election in any year occurring more than ninety (90) days from the filing of such petition, if no date be so fixed. No such ordinance or resolution shall go into effect until approved by a majority of those voting thereon. When the Council by law or under provisions of general ordinances, is required to pass more than one ordinance or resolution necessary to make and pay for any public improvement, the referendum provisions shall apply only to the first ordinance or resolution required to be passed and not to any subsequent ordinances or resolutions relating thereto. Ordinances providing for the annual tax levy or for improvements petitioned by the owners of a majority of the feet front of the property benefitted and to be specially assessed therefor, and appropriation ordinances limited to the subject of appropriations shall not be subject to referendum, but all other ordinances, including emergency ordinances, shall be subject to referendum, except that emergency ordinances shall go into effect at the time indicated therein. If, when submitted to a vote of the electors, an emergency measure be not approved by a majority of those voting thereon, it shall be considered repealed as regards any further action thereunder; but such measure shall be deemed sufficient authority for payment, in accordance with the ordinance, of any expense incurred previous to the referendum vote thereon.

Ordinances submitted to the Council by initiative petition and passed by the Council either with or without change, but not required to be submitted to a vote of the electors, shall be subject to referendum in the same manner as other ordinances.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 09

Purpose					
Brief description of the purp	pose of the proposal:				
An amendment providing the	An amendment providing that the Vice Mayor shall preside at all meetings of Coun				
cil.		-			
Problem					
Brief description of the prob	blem being addressed by the	proposal:			
The Council and Mayor are separate but co-equal branches of government. The cur-					
rent language of the Charte	er requires that the Mayor p	oreside at all meetings of the			
Council. This structure inv	ites conflict because it dema	ands that the Mayor conduct			
the meetings of the Council	l. The proposed amendment	to the Charter would elimi-			
_		ne Council, thereby ensuring			
• • •	eway to run its meetings ind				
Charter Provisions	, S	ı			
Charter provision(s) propos	sed to be deleted or amended,	, if applicable:			
Art. 3; Art. 4.					
Procedure and Vote					
Proponent(s): Kretch					
Date of first discussion: Ma	arch 14, 2023				
Date of second discussion:	April 4, 2023				
Date of motion to adopt: A	pril 4, 2023				
Movant: Kretch					
Second: Jackson					
Commissioners present: Wertheim, Crick, Sloan	Crumrine, Farkas, Duffy-Friedman, Go	ould, Jackson, Kretch, Marshall, My-			
Vote result: [9] Yes [0] No [1] Abstain	1				
Roll call vote:					
Farkas □ Yes □ No ⊠ Abstain	Gould \square Yes \square No \square Abstain	Sloan ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain			
Marshall \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Bobes \square Yes \square No \square Abstain	$Jackson \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain$			
Myrick \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Wertheim \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Duffy-Friedman ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain			
Kretch \boxtimes Yes \square No \square Abstain	Crumrine ⊠ Yes □ No □ Abstain				

ARTICLE 3. COUNCIL

* * *

SECTION 5. Procedure. A majority of the members elected to the Council shall constitute a quorum for the transaction of business, but a less number may adjourn from time to time and compel the attendance of absent members. The Council shall keep a journal of its proceedings.

All regular and special meetings of Council and Council committees shall be publicly announced and shall be open to the public in accordance with the provisions of the Ohio "Sunshine Law" as it may be amended from time to time, presently codified at Section 121.22 of the Ohio Revised Code. The Vice Mayor, or in the Vice Mayor's absence the Vice Mayor's designee, shall preside at all meetings of Council. Council may hold an executive session at any regular or special meeting of Council, upon the majority roll call vote of a quorum of Council, for the sole purpose of the consideration of any matter specified in Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22, as it may be amended from time to time.

The Council shall, by ordinance, make provision for the following:

- a. The time and place of regular meetings, providing for at least two regular meetings in each calendar month excepting the months of July and August;
 - b. The manner of calling special meetings;
- c. The enforcement of attendance at its meetings and punishment of disorderly conduct thereat;
- d. The form and method of enacting ordinances and resolutions, but no ordinance or resolution except general appropriation ordinances shall contain more than one subject which shall be clearly stated in the title; and general appropriation ordinances shall be confined to the subject of appropriations;
- e. The manner of giving public notice of the enactment of ordinances and of any other of its acts or proceedings which it deems proper to publish;
- f. The reduction of unpaid installments and the return of paid installments of assessments levied in larger amounts than necessary to pay for public improvements, to the extent that such reductions and returns are authorized by the general law of Ohio;

- g. The procedure for making public improvements and for levying assessments, provided that two or more public improvements, including the levying of assessments therefor, may be combined in one proceeding if the Council finds that it will be economical and practical to undertake said improvements jointly;
 - h. The advertising and awarding of contracts;
- i. The employment of expert consultants to advise and assist the city officials and employees with respect to municipal problems and such other general regulations as the Council may deem necessary;
- j. The printing, publishing and distribution of financial reports and such other reports of general interest as the Council shall determine, at City expense, providing that such reports shall be factual only and do not express an opinion or promote any person, position, group of persons, or any idea, theory or viewpoint of a political or controversial nature.

* * *

ARTICLE 5. THE MAYOR

* * *

SECTION 4. General Powers and Duties.

- A. Judicial. The Mayor shall have all the judicial powers granted by the general laws of Ohio to mayors of cities, unless and until other lawful provisions shall be made for the exercise of such powers.
- B. Legislative. The Mayor shall preside at all meetings of the Council and shall have the power to veto as specified in Article 3 Section 7 of this Charter. The Mayor and directors of all departments established by this Charter, or by ordinance, also shall be entitled to seats in the Council. Neither the Mayor nor any director of any department shall have a vote in the Council, but the Mayor shall have the right to introduce ordinances and to take part in the discussion of all matters coming before the Council; and the directors of departments shall be entitled to take part in all discussions in the Council relating to their respective departments.

* * *

C. Executive. The Mayor shall be the chief executive officer of the City. He shall supervise the administration of the City's affairs, and shall exercise control over all departments and divisions except those reserved to Council or its officers and employees by this Charter. He shall be the chief conservator of the peace within the City and shall see that all laws and ordinances are enforced therein. He shall be responsible for the preparation and submission to the Council of the annual estimate of receipts and expenditures, and appropriation measure, and shall at all times keep the Council fully advised as to the financial condition and needs of the City. He shall recommend to the Council such measures as he deems necessary or expedient. He shall see that all terms and conditions imposed in favor of this City or its inhabitants in any franchise or contract to which this City is a party are faithfully kept and performed.

The Mayor shall appoint all officers and employees of the City, except members, officers and employees of the Council, judges, Clerk of Council and the Director of Law and their assistants. All persons appointed by the Mayor, except those whose terms of office are fixed by this Charter or by law, may be promoted, transferred, reduced or removed by the Mayor, subject however, to the Civil Service provisions of this Charter. The foregoing appointive powers of the Mayor may be delegated by him to the directors of any department or to the heads of any divisions with respect to the officers or employees in the classified service within their respective departments or divisions.

The Mayor shall execute on behalf of the City all contracts, conveyances, evidences of indebtedness and all other instruments to which the City is a party.

The Mayor shall be recognized as the official and ceremonial head of the City government, by the governor for military purposes, and by the courts for the purpose of serving civil processes.

Proposed Amendment to the Charter No. 10

1-				
n				
e				
protections provided by state and federal law.				
Charter provision(s) proposed to be deleted or amended, if applicable:				
1				

ARTICLE 8. MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS

* * *

SECTION 12. The City shall not discriminate on the basis of race, color, national origin, religion, age, disability, marital or partnership status, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, genetic information, pregnancy, citizenship status, caste, tribal affiliation or any other classification protected by applicable federal, state, or local law unless reasonably necessary to normal operations and having a substantial relationship to job function and responsibilities.