Mayor Rothschild called the meeting to order at 7:35 p.m.

Roll Call: Present: Mrs. Adele H. Zucker  
Mr. Steven D. Bullock (not at roll call)  
Mr. Kevin Patrick Murphy  
Mr. Peter R. Bernardo  
Mr. Frank Consolo  
Mr. Steven Sims  

Absent: Ms. Frankie B. Goldberg  

Also Present: Clerk of Council Nancy E. English  
Law Director Kenneth J. Fisher  
Acting Law Director Robert Mansour  
Finance Director Arman R. Ochoa  
Chief of Police Gary Stehlík  
Fire Chief John Pitchler  
Community Coordinator Walter Stinson  
Building Commissioner William C. Nadeau  
City Engineer Joseph R. Ciuni  

MOTION BY MR. CONSOLO, SECONDED BY MR. BERNARDO to excuse the absence of Ms. Goldberg and Mr. Bullock. On roll call, all voted “aye.”

Minutes of the meeting held on April 7, 2008  

MOTION BY MRS. ZUCKER, SECONDED BY MR. SIMS to approve the minutes of the April 7, 2008 meeting. On roll call, all voted “aye.”

Certificates of Recognition to The A Cappella Choir of Heights High School  

Mayor Rothschild presented the Certificates of Recognition to Choir Director Craig McGaughey, Choir President Liza Lieberman and Assistant Director Kari Sharpe for winning a competition on WJW Fox 8 News Program as the best of nine choirs that performed on the station’s morning show. After a week of online voting, viewers of the morning show cast their votes and declared the Heights High A Cappella Choir the winner. The choir received a plaque which was awarded on February 7, 2008. Mayor Rothschild noted that the Cleveland Heights-University Heights City School District is well known for its music program. She added that the theatrical production of Fiddler on the Roof was outstanding. The choir will perform its final concert of the year on Friday, May 16, 2008.

Agenda Items:

A. Presentation of John Carroll University’s Master Plan - Doreen Riley, VP of University Advancement and Nicholas Santilli, Assoc. VP of Assessment and Planning  

Present representing John Carroll University (JCU) were Dr. Nicholas Santilli, Associate Academic Vice President for Assessment and Planning, Ms. Doreen Riley, Vice President for University Advancement, Mr. Jerry Sheehan, Associate Vice President for Community and Government Relations and Barbara Paynter of Hennes Communications LLC, a consultant working with JCU.

Dr. Santilli gave an update on John Carroll University’s proposed campus master plan. He started with background information noting that the university has seen an enrollment decline from 4,250 full-time students in 1998 to approximately 3,650 full-time students today. Dr. Santilli stated that the proposed plan is designed to create a compelling campus and academic and student life experiences in order to attract a diverse mix of students that will allow the university to maximize its net tuition revenue in order to remain a healthy institution.

Dr. Santilli noted that JCU is the largest income tax generator for the City, contributing approximately 10% of the City’s total income revenue annually. He also noted that 39% of the university’s 547 full-time employees live in University Heights and the immediate surrounding communities. Dr. Santilli mentioned that the university also pays property taxes on the houses, apartments and the Fairmount Circle shopping center, which it owns in both University Heights and Shaker Heights.
Dr. Santilli also pointed out that JCU’s students, faculty and staff are active in the community and 58% of the university’s graduates stay in Ohio, and nearly 80% of the Ohio based alumni live in the Greater Cleveland and Northeast Ohio area, thereby contributing to the Ohio economy.

Dr. Santilli stated that John Carroll University recognizes that it cannot stand still because there is a demographic shift occurring in the traditional 18-22 year old students, which is currently peaking in the university market and extending to the year 2014. He noted that the Great Lakes region and the northeast generally show a rapid decrease in the projected graduation of 18 year olds while the southwest and southeast show an increase.

Dr. Santilli stated that due to this demographic shift it is important for John Carroll University to make changes on its campus. He noted that the expectations of students are higher due to the advanced facilities in the elementary and high schools where they come from. In addition to academic facilities, potential students are looking to other aspects of campus life, including recreational facilities. Dr. Santilli noted that the newest trend emerging is the concept of “living/learning communities” whereby learning is continuous 24/7. Under this concept, the students have mixed use facilities: sleeping rooms, class rooms, and seminar rooms which are fully wired for computers. These facilities give students the opportunity to live with other students who are studying the same things. Dr. Santilli noted that students are looking for apartment style or suite style residence halls as they advance through their four years at the university. He noted that JCU must move from the dark, traditional dorm room residence halls to the living/learning facilities with open spaces and natural light to facilitate a different learning environment.

Dr. Santilli noted that the alternative is for John Carroll University to become smaller, which will not benefit the university, the City or the neighborhood in general. He added that a decline in student population would mean a decline in faculty, staff and other employees. Dr. Santilli mentioned that four years ago JCU had 648 full-time employees today there are 547. He also noted that there has been a 30% drop in faculty from 244 full-time faculty members in 2003 to 213 in 2007.

Councilman Steven D. Bullock and Law Director Kenneth J. Fisher entered the meeting at 7:55 p.m.

Dr. Santilli stated that the proposed campus master plan is a facilities plan which is part of a larger strategic plan, which is driven by the academic mission of the university. The proposed campus master plan is meant to accentuate JCU’s academic programs, boost the university’s marketing and recruiting efforts so as to increase the strength of the university, which will in turn increase the vitality of the region.

Dr. Santilli explained that the process of developing the master plan has been a collaborative effort from the onset of the project and will continue through completion. He noted that everyone’s needs have been addressed --the university’s, the neighbors and the Cities of University Heights and Shaker Heights -- in order to come up with a solution that is best for everyone. He added that a community liaison panel has been established to improve communications with residents. Dr. Santilli thanked Community Coordinator Walter Stinson for his regular attendance at the community liaison panel meetings.

Dr. Santilli stated that JCU started working with Sasaki Associates, Inc. on February 7, 2007. He noted that since that time, periodic updates have been given to the Cities of University Heights and Shaker Heights, the resident neighbors surrounding the university in both cities, as well as Gesu Parish and School and the Fairmount Circle Merchants. He added that many of the ideas which have come from outside the university have been incorporated into the plan and others are still being addressed.

Dr. Santilli noted that homes surrounding the university were purchased for different reasons. Along Warrensville Center and Milford Road, those homes were purchased for play fields and parking. In the Carroll Blvd and Kerwick Road neighborhood, those homes are intended for faculty and senior administrators and their families. Dr. Santilli stated that JCU had seriously considered parking or play fields in that area because of its adjacency to the other athletic fields, but John Carroll has decided for the foreseeable future to preserve that area for housing and maintain the residential character of the neighborhood by using these homes for faculty and staff.

Dr. Santilli stated that John Carroll University’s goal is to meet the university’s needs, give the university flexibility in the changing conditions and try to accommodate the concerns of the neighbors and community leaders. He noted that they are trying to do as much as they can within the existing footprint and to do it as unobtrusively as possible. Dr. Santilli stated that they are not asking for approval at this meeting. The presentation was for informational purposes only. He noted a community meeting is scheduled for April 29, 2008 in the auditorium of the Dolan Science Center on the JCU campus. Representatives of JCU will meet with the City of Shaker Heights and other neighborhood groups as necessary prior to taking the plan back to the university’s board of directors.
Dr. Santili stated the driving goals for the campus master plan are to: increase enrollment, celebrate the academic programs, improve student life and athletics, diversify and expand housing choices, address parking needs, improve community relations, and to use resources wisely. He noted that this vision will carry John Carroll University 20 to 25 years into the future.

Ms. Doreen Reilly presented the early phase of the draft campus master plan. She presented the existing campus and then expanded to the various zones which Sasaki Associates, Inc. helped the university identify. She noted that Sasaki’s recommendation was to open the campus. In the PowerPoint display and the handout, the areas which were shaded green indicated JCU’s vision of the campus footprint, which spanned a 20-year time period. Ms. Reilly stated that the early phase goals (as of 4/21/08) which would be accomplished within the next couple of years: decommission (demolish) Bohannon Science Center and restore green space on the Hamlin Quad in order to address parking; build a fitness center addition adjacent to the existing student center, which would be opened to the community; construct apartment style residence halls “gateway housing 1 and 2” for upperclassmen (juniors and seniors); renovate existing student housing; construct a play field on Milford Road (site of five existing houses owned by JCU with a sixth house to act as a buffer from the residential community) - proposed play field may also be used by Gesu School; add off-campus parking at existing Temple Emanu El site with shuttle service (would allow freshmen to have cars on campus) -- rented parking at University Square would be eliminated at the end of May; reconfigure internal spaces within the Dolan Science Center; renovate student center with unique fresh food concept dining as well as other internal renovations; and replace the varsity track and field and baseball and softball fields within the next 2 to 3 years. Ms. Reilly noted that the estimated cost of the early phase improvements is over $80 million. Therefore, the university is in the process of prioritizing and determining how to come up with the finances.

Ms. Reilly reviewed the long term plan for North Park area, which is being considered for a college town concept, which would be a mixed use on the lower level and loft style apartments on the second story and parking. She noted that the roadway along North Park Blvd. would have to remain open even though Sasaki Associates recommended closing the street to vehicular traffic for a true college town atmosphere.

Ms. Reilly also noted that in the short term and long term, the three apartments which JCU owns in the Fairmount Circle area will receive minor modifications and be used to relocate students during the residence hall renovations as apartment units become available. She noted that there are no plans to use these apartment buildings for 100% student dwellings. She added that 20% of the units are currently student occupied, which has been a concern for Shaker Heights residents. Ms. Reilly stated that next year freshmen and sophomores will be required to live on campus which will be good for the university and the local neighborhoods. She noted that the ultimate goal is to also have juniors and seniors on campus to serve as mentors and role models for the underclassmen.

Ms. Reilly reviewed the academic core of the campus (includes the majority of classrooms, Dolan Science Center, Grasselli Library, and administration building). She mentioned plans to renovate the lower level of the administration building in order to institute a one-stop service center and create some exciting learning spaces.

With regard to traffic and the existing parking lot off S. Belvoir Blvd., Ms. Reilly noted that Sasaki has recommended creating a pedestrian friendly crossing at its current location with a raised roadway to slow traffic and relocating the Belvoir parking lot entrance to the south; thereby creating a safer environment for the 600+ students who cross S. Belvoir Blvd. on a daily basis. Ms. Reilly noted that some parking will be lost with this plan.

Ms. Reilly stated that in addition to replacing the football field and track, the university needs six tennis courts in order to comply with NCAA regulations (three existing.) She noted that three additional tennis courts are being proposed adjacent to the three existing courts. Ms. Reilly also noted that dugouts must be installed for the women’s softball teams in accordance with NCAA Title 9 regulations. She noted that the baseball fields are proposed to be resurfaced with artificial turf to extend the life of the fields and then install one level below grade parking underneath the field. She added that they considered a below parking garage under the play field on Milton Road also, but it is a very expensive endeavor at an estimated $18-20 million parking garage. Ms. Reilly noted that the demand on the play fields are overwhelming and JCU even has to use Bellefaire’s field for soccer practice and rent fields around town. A field house is also proposed with underground parking.

Ms. Reilly noted that the university had originally thought of the Carroll/Kerwick area for play fields; however, due to the issues raised by neighbors and the City, JCU has decided for the short term to retain the residential character of the neighborhood and put senior administrators and faculty into those homes until the university sort outs its parking, play fields and residence hall needs. She mentioned that the long term options for Carroll/Kerwick area may change. Ms. Reilly reviewed existing parking and proposed parking at peak level enrollment.
Ms. Reilly noted that several long term items still need to be addressed such as needs for the student center, parking, and the viability of the commercial district. She noted that JCU is proposing to rename North Park Blvd. off Fairmount Circle to Carroll Blvd. in order the make the campus easier to find. The university must also address a residence for a future non-Jesuit president. Other items include a guest house and a visible welcome center. Ms. Reilly stated that finances still needs to be addressed. She noted that the Sasaki plan cannot be accomplished in its totality; therefore, they are looking at what to do now and what to do in the long term.

Ms. Reilly stated that John Carroll University’s overall vision will be dependent on assistance from the residents and City. Ms. Reilly stated that the entire process has been open and collaborative and JCU would like to keep those lines of communication open. Ms. Reilly opened the floor to questions.

Mayor Rothschild inquired as to how many students the two proposed residence halls will hold at the front of campus. Ms. Reilly replied that the concept is 250-300 students per building. Mayor Rothschild noted that in one of the earlier concepts it was proposed that North Park Blvd. be closed to vehicular traffic. Ms. Reilly noted that the university is proposing not to close North Park Blvd. She noted that it would take a major traffic study to determine where to re-route the traffic.

Mr. Consolo asked about the fitness center and the field house. Ms. Reilly responded that the field house has not generated a lot of excitement on campus and is not in the short term plans. She noted that the fitness center concept, which may be open to the community, has been highly accepted and will be pursued. Dr. Santilli added that Sasaki has recommended having glass walls on the front of the fitness center to showcase the sense of life on campus. Mr. Consolo inquired if a pool will be included in the proposed fitness center, and if so, would it be open to the community. Ms. Reilly replied that there is an existing pool on campus, but one can be considered since the planning is in the early stages of development.

Dr. Santilli mentioned that a welcome center is one of the significant items that needs to be addressed because it would allow the university to control the way visitors and prospective students enter the campus. He added that this will allow the admissions counselors to give the prospective students the guided tour that would enhance the desirability of the students and families to choose John Carroll University.

Mayor Rothschild asked Ms. Reilly to address the Carroll/Kerwick area and inquired if part of the plan is to take more houses. Ms. Reilly stated that the university is proposing a small play field on Milford Road because the university does not own all the houses on Warrensville Center Road that it needs. She added that JCU is interested in purchasing homes on Warrensville Center Road as they become available and also the BP property. Ms. Reilly also noted the university is not looking to purchase more homes in the Carroll/Kerwick area, but if some were to become available they would consider it because of long term flexibility options. She noted that for the short term, the houses will remain for senior staff and faculty, not students. She added that there are students in the Milford Road houses on year to year leases.

Mayor Rothschild also inquired about the future of the North Park retail area. Ms. Reilly stated that the university loves the concept that Sasaki designed, but it would be very challenging to accomplish due to the current economic conditions unless they could partner with someone to facilitate it.

Vice Mayor Zucker asked how the university plans to facilitate parking for the proposed upperclassmen residence halls when parking is being taken away from the Dolan Science Center. Dr. Santilli stated that the underground parking under the Dolan Center must be reassessed. He also noted that residential students would use the Temple Emanu El site if that is utilized for parking with a shuttle service. Dr. Santilli also mentioned that some parking will be reclaimed with the demolition of the Bohannon Center and other smaller lots.

Diane Ruppe, 2603 Traymore Road, inquired as to how the university will address the shift in the tax burden from JCU to the residents when the houses are demolished for the play fields. Ms. Reilly clarified the only houses being proposed for demolition in the short term are five houses on Milford Road. She noted that the JCU is paying property taxes on the homes in the Carroll/Kerwick area. Ms. Reilly added that if some properties come off the tax duplicate, that is something which could be discussed with the Council in the future.

Mr. Sims asked when the master plan will be presented to the JCU board for action. Ms. Reilly responded that the plan will be presented to the City of Shaker Heights and its residents next week, and then the plan will be discussed with the JCU board in May. She noted that the board has seen the concept and given the university president and the administrators the authority to act on the plan.
Ms. Reilly noted that in May, they will show the board the plan, explain what they would like to do in the short term, and explain how the improvements will be funded. She added that individual aspects will be approved by the board as it goes forward.

Mr. Sims noted that there are current efforts going forward to talk about the master plan in a collaborative effort with the City, the residents and university on how the plan can work for everyone. He added that there are parts in the process that are yet to be determined. Mr. Sims asked for assurance that as the dialogue continues there will opportunity for firm understanding as to what could happen and what will not happen. Ms. Reilly replied that they are committed to working with the City and neighbors to come up with a solution that works for everyone. She noted that the university understands it cannot accomplish this plan independent from everyone else. Mr. Sims noted he believes the proposed master plan is a good plan, but he also believes the collaborative efforts are important because compromises must be reached in certain areas.

Mr. Fisher inquired if the university has closed on the Temple Emanu El property. Ms. Reilly stated that the university will not close on the property until late summer when the Temple’s new building is ready. She noted that they intend to use the property for parking if the City permits. She added that there are approximately 250 parking spaces on the site, and they will meet with Heimen’s and other institutions which use the lot for parking to assess their needs as well. She noted that in the short term the building will remain. Ms. Reilly stated that they will come to the city with a plan prior to closing on the property.

Mayor Rothschild suggested that plans be clearing marked Phase 1 and Phase 2 so that everyone will know where the university is headed. She requested clarity on the residential district of Carroll Blvd., Kerwick and Hadleigh Roads. Ms. Reilly stated that she distributed the “early phase” at this meeting, but will forward an “overall phase.” She explained that they plan on coming back for city approval after the board meeting as the plan continues to evolve. Mayor Rothschild stated that houses which the university does not plan to touch should be shown on the 20 year plan. She noted that this must be clarified. Mr. Bernardo stated that the university has not gone outside of its footprint which was represented in green on the handout.

Mr. Bullock stated that the university should find a way to eliminate all fuzziness with the plan so that everybody can be clear as to exactly what will occur. He asked about the change in the college town concept for North Park. Ms. Reilly clarified that Sasaki Associates showed North Park completely closed to vehicular traffic, but she believes that will be an issue without the a traffic study.

Mr. Bullock stated that he thinks it is a great plan. He suggested continued and frequent communications as the various phases move forward. Mr. Bullock inquired as to what the total cost would be for all the improvements under the proposed master plan. Ms. Reilly stated that under Sasaki’s plan the total cost would be approximately $400 million. She noted that until they actually decide what to do and really get into the construction aspect everything is just an estimate. She noted that phase 1 is realistic to accomplish within the next two years. Mr. Bullock stated that it would good if he could say, “this is what is we’ll be looking at happening two or three years from now,” but the unknown is what creates questions. Ms. Reilly stated that they are trying to get to that point.

Diane Ruppe, 2603 Traymore Rd., suggested that JCU think of another way to resolve its issues without demolishing the larger family homes surrounding the campus. She added that the homes should be resold to individuals.

Patrick O’Shaughnessy, 2624 Kerwick Rd., congratulated John Carroll University on the presentation and for the clarity and communication. He noted that there is still a lot of fuzziness with the plan in regard to selling any of the homes back in the Carroll/Kerwick area. He stated that there is one constant which most people agree and that is on that the homes should be sold back. Mr. O’Shaughnessy stated that they are trying to develop a plan which is beneficial to everyone in a spirit of compromise and cooperation. He inquired as to who from JCU would sign a cooperative agreement between the City, the residents and the university. Ms. Reilly stated that it’s a too early to say, but it probably would be the president or the president and board combined. She added that they are interested in talking about it.

Jim Barker, 14318 Washington Blvd., thanked JCU for its presentation and dialogue about cooperation facilitated by the residents. He requested to be part of that dialogue because he is a JCU neighbor as well.

Mr. Sims inquired as to what will happen to facilitate construction of the three additional tennis courts and if it would involve the demolition of any homes. Ms. Reilly stated that the site identified for the additional tennis courts is the existing site of the career center, which is in a house owned by the university. She noted that no studies have been completed, but it may take at least one or possibly two of the homes adjacent to the tennis courts in order to meet NCAA regulations.
Mayor Rothschild noted that the City has an agreement with Bellefaire for its tennis courts so that is something that could be discussed. Mr. Santilli stated that they currently using three of the Bellefaire tennis courts.

Mr. Bernardo stated that he does not understand the lack of clarity regarding the houses in the Carroll/Kerwick area. He noted that the property taxes will still be paid by JCU. The individuals living in the homes will be some of the highest paid employees of the university who pay income tax. He asked what the problem is with the people living in houses owned by John Carroll University.

Mr. Bullock replied that he is not concerned about the people who are living in the houses as much as he is concerned about what will happen to properties in the long term.

Mr. Murphy responded that he does not mind that they live in the houses, but he would rather that they purchase the homes because there is a higher level of care when an individual owns a home. Mr. Murphy added that it is not an issue regarding the people, but rather how John Carroll acquired the houses. Mr. Santilli noted that JCU has invested numerous dollars into maintaining the homes they own. Mr. Murphy disagreed and stated that the level of maintenance is not the same.

Mrs. Zucker stated that she does not have a problem with the people living in the homes, but the properties went from two income professional salary properties to one income properties. Mr. Bernardo stated that not all the homes were two income households. Mr. O’Shaughnessy noted that 90% of the households in the area not owned by JCU, are owned by college educated two income families.

Mr. Consolo noted that the residents of Bushnell Road and Lansdale Road asked for dialogue when an outside corporation tried to come into their neighborhood, but they were not embraced by the City. He added, however, that residents of the Kerwick/Carroll area have been embraced by the City with dialogue. Mr. Consolo stated that there is no fuzziness on his part. He stated that he does not believe government can tell a property owner to sell back its property, adding that John Carroll University is an established corporate citizen of the City too.

Mr. Sims stated that his view of the situation involving the Bushnell/Lansdale area, was there was a business entity with the possibility of locating in the city, and it wasn’t about supporting or not supporting the residents, but rather it was about whether or not the Council supported the proposal which never reached the point were the Council as a whole supported the proposal. Mr. Sims noted that he did not support the proposal.

Mr. Murphy stated that the Kerwick/Carroll homeowners are trying to establish a footprint with John Carroll University and the City. He noted that residents from all parts of the city are welcome to participate, and he personally invited Mr. Barker to join the group.

Mr. O’Shaughnessy stated the Carroll/Kerwick neighborhood is no better than any other neighborhood, but they are defending the Carroll/Kerwick area because JCU’s current footprint does not include those houses. He added that even though the homes are being rented now, the residents are concerned about what will happen to the neighborhood in the future.

Mayor Rothschild closed this portion of the meeting by requesting that any fuzziness be cleared up and that the dialogue process be continued.

B. Motion to advertise for bids for the purchase and installation for three light poles adjacent to the sidewalk at Purvis Park

City Engineer Joseph R. Ciuni reported that as part of the lot split approved by the Planning Commission for the tennis courts at Purvis Park, the Heights Jewish Center requested that lighting be installed along the sidewalk adjacent to the tennis courts at Purvis Park leading to Wrenford Road. He noted that the project would consist of approximately 300 feet of underground electrical wiring, conduit and trench work with electrical service supplied from the bathhouse. Mr. Ciuni recommended three light poles similar to the light poles currently existing a Purvis Park be purchased and installed at a estimated cost of $18,000.

MOTION BY MR. BERNARDO, SECONDED BY MR. BULLOCK to advertise for bids for the purchase and installation for three light poles adjacent to the sidewalk at Purvis Park. On roll call, all voted “aye.”
C. Ordinance No. 2008-12 to provide for the issuance and sale of Bond Anticipation Notes in anticipation of the issuance of bonds for various purposes

Ordinance No. 2008-12 provides for the issuance and sale of not to exceed $2,595,000 Bond Anticipation Notes of the City of University Heights, Ohio in anticipation of the issuance of bonds for the following various purposes: (a) the 2001 Motorized Equipment Project ($110,000), (b) the 2001 Street Improvement Project ($245,000), (c) the 2002 Street Improvement Project ($245,000), (d) the 2003 Street Improvement Project ($145,000), (e) the 2004 Street Improvement Project ($400,000), (f) the 2004 Motorized Equipment Project ($100,000), (g) the 2005 Motorized Equipment Project ($85,500), (h) the 2005 Street Improvement Project ($414,500), (i) the 2006 Sewer Project ($300,000), (j) the 2006 Motorized Equipment Project ($350,000), and (k) the 2006 Street Improvement Project ($200,000). Mr. Ochoa noted that the Bond Anticipation Notes will mature on May 8, 2008. He noted that interest is due in the amount of $113,690.81. Mr. Ochoa stated that the 2007 Salt Bin Notes will be paid down the full $200,000 plus interest.

MOTION BY MR. SIMS, SECONDED BY MRS. ZUCKER to approve the passage of Ordinance No. 2008-12 as an emergency measure. On roll call, on suspension of rules, all voted “aye.” On roll call, on passage, all voted “aye.”

D. Ordinance No. 2008-13 Awarding the 2008 Road Improvement Program to Delta Asphalt Company

Mr. Ciuni reported that bids were opened on March 14, 2008, for the jointly bid 2008 Road Improvement Program between the City of University Heights and Shaker Heights. He noted that University Heights’ two (2) streets (Loyola Road and Edgerton Road from Hillbrook to Meadowbrook) are included in Shaker Heights’ program. The total low bid was received from Delta Asphalt Company in the amount of $1,048,940.42. The total cost for the University Heights’ portion was $164,229.00. Mr. Ciuni noted that the cost was higher than the $140,000 estimate due to the rising cost of asphalt and because the City of Shaker Heights’ specifications required virgin materials not recycled asphalt. Mr. Ciuni noted that he contacted Delta Asphalt Company to determine if University Heights could receive a credit for using the standard ODOT mix instead of using virgin materials. A response had not been received at the time of this meeting. In response to a question by Mayor Rothschild, Mr. Ciuni noted that the life expectancy of the recycled asphalt is just as long as that made with virgin materials. Mr. Ciuni stated that Delta Asphalt Company performed University Heights’ 2007 Road Improvement Program and he recommended that University Heights inform Shaker Heights to proceed with the work on University Heights’ streets.

Mr. Consolo stated that he will be voting no on the ordinance because the review required to apprise Council of the merits of this ordinance was not done by University Heights staff and the price estimate had increased nearly $25,000.00 in only 4 months time. Mr. Consolo noted that according to the April 15, 2008 letter from University Heights City Engineer Joe Ciuni, the Service Director of the City of Shaker Heights checked the bids received and was making a recommendation to award the contract to Delta Asphalt. The letter also noted that the price increase was due in part to the City of Shaker Heights specification that prohibits the use of recycled asphalt. Based on this, Mr. Consolo stated that he thought that University Heights had improperly delegated its authority to receive and approve bids for its own street work to Shaker Heights and could not, therefore, vote for the ordinance.

Ordinance No. 2008-13 awards the 2008 Road Improvement Program to the lowest and/or best bidder, Delta Asphalt Company, Tallmadge, Ohio in the amount not to exceed $164,229. Mr. Ochoa reported that $200,000 has been budgeted for the 2008 Road Improvement Program. In response to questions, Mr. Fisher stated that contract will be a tri-party contract between University Heights, Shaker Heights and Delta Asphalt Company. Mr. Ochoa added that University Heights will receive an invoice from Delta Asphalt based on the actual use of asphalt on our streets. Mr. Ciuni pointed out that his office will oversee the construction of University Heights’ streets.

MOTION BY MRS. ZUCKER, SECONDED BY MR. SIMS to approve the passage of Ordinance No. 2008-13 as an emergency measure. On roll call, on suspension of rules, all voted “aye,” except Mr. Consolo, who voted “nay.” On roll call, on passage, all voted “aye,” except Mr. Consolo, who voted “nay.”

E. Ordinance No. 2008-14 Establishing Section 1620.02 (d) of the Codified Ordinances by establishing an Inspection Fee Schedule for the Fire Department for annual inspections of non-residential structures and occupancies

Ordinance No. 2008-14 establishes Section 1620.02(d) of the Codified Ordinances by establishing a fee schedule for inspection of non-residential structures and occupancies. Mr. Bullock stated that the Safety Committee met on April 14, 2008 and discussed and recommended approval of agenda items “E,” “F,”
He noted that the establishment of Section 1620.02(d) will institute the second phase to Ord. No. 2008-10 which was passed on April 7, 2008 authorizing fees and inspections for new or renovated structures. Fire Chief John Pitchler added that the ordinance provides a means for the Fire Department to hold businesses accountable for non-compliance of Fire Code regulations. He noted that there is no charge for the annual inspections, or the follow-up inspection if violations are found. However, if there has to be a third inspection the fee will be $100 and $200 for any subsequent inspections.

**MOTION BY MR. BULLOCK, SECONDED BY MRS. ZUCKER to approve the passage of Ordinance No. 2008-14 as an emergency measure. On roll call, on suspension of rules, all voted “aye.” On roll call, on passage, all voted “aye.”**

F. Ordinance No. 2008-15 Authorizing the purchase of one 2008 Jeep Grand Cherokee for the Fire Department and one 2008 Chevrolet Tahoe for the Police Department through the State Purchasing Program

Ordinance No. 2008-15 authorizes the purchase of one 2008 Jeep Grand Cherokee for the Fire Department in an amount not to exceed $21,676 and one 2008 Chevrolet Tahoe for the Police Department in an amount not to exceed $31,177 through the Ohio Cooperative Purchasing Program.

The vehicles will be purchased from Taylor Motors of Lancaster, Ohio, which has the State contracts for these vehicles.

Fire Chief Pitchler explained that the Jeep Grand Cherokee will replace the Dodge Durango which has 140,000 miles on it. The chief will get the new vehicle, his existing vehicle will be passed down to the executive captain/fire prevention officer, and the Dodge Durango will either be used as a second utility vehicle or put up for sale in auction. Chief Pitchler stated that the Jeep Grand Cherokee was chosen for its safety factor and because it will be used to carry fire prevention and arson investigation equipment. He added that supplies are stored in the vehicle as well as being used for transport of other equipment and supplies.

Mr. Consolo stated that he will be voting no on this ordinance as well as Ordinance No. 2208-16 authorizing the purchase of three (3) more police vehicles. Mr. Consolo reminded Council that thirteen months ago, in Ordinance No. 2007-13, a previous Council had approved the purchase of five (5) Jeep Grand Cherokees – four (4) for the police department and one (1) for the fire department in the amount of $120,000.00. Mr. Consolo noted that now Council is being asked in these two ordinances to approve the purchase of two (2) more SUVs as well as two new police cruisers at a cost of nearly $100,000.00. Mr. Consolo stated that he could not see the need for a City of 1.9 square miles having so many SUVs and police and fire vehicles and he could not justify the spending of over $220,000.00 in 13 months on just police and fire vehicles.

Mr. Consolo questioned the need for city-owned personal vehicles and inquired if it had ever been considered for the chief and other appropriate personnel to use their own personal vehicles and to get reimbursed for mileage. Chief Pitchler responded that it had not been considered because emergency equipment is carried in the vehicle and he and the executive captain are on call 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. Mr. Consolo inquired as to how University Heights compares to other cities regarding this procedure. Chief Pitchler replied that it is a standard policy for the chief and assistant chief to receive SUV type vehicles. Mr. Consolo stated that the City purchased vehicles last year and he feels the city should tighten its belts. Mr. Consolo stated that he is against the purchase of vehicles as he does not see the need or the justification for the vehicles.

Mayor Rothschild stated that there are cutoff dates for ordering the vehicles. Mr. Consolo mentioned that he understands that, but the items should have been brought to the Council earlier. Mr. Bullock stated that the items were discussed in Safety Committee meeting to determine if the items should go forward now, later or not at all. He noted that the committee recommended to go forward with this item and recommended to postpone the kitchen renovation in the Fire Department’s living quarters until the last six month of the year in order to watch the budget. Mr. Consolo was in favor of the kitchen renovation because it would have supported all the members of the Fire Department.

Mr. Bernardo inquired if a capital purchase is projected for next year. Chief Pitchler stated that there will not be a vehicle purchase, but a new rescue squad is planned for purchase next year. Chief Pitchler stated that he presented his five-year projection in February of this year where he explained all the vehicles and equipment which is anticipated for purchase. Mr. Bullock stated that the vehicles are not for personal use, but rather for City use, especially during emergency situations. He added that vehicles will be needed in the future in order for the departments to function. Mayor Rothschild stated that University Heights keeps its vehicles longer than other cities.
Chief Pitchler noted that the City takes in $200,000 per year from the rescue squads. He wanted to put a percentage of that money away to purchase a new rescue squad when it’s needed, but the City did not have the money to do that. Chief Pitchler stated that he does not want to get into another situation where two older squads were down at the same time and the City did not have a rescue squad in service. He added that it is critical for the City to maintain its vehicles. He noted that the engine in the pumper should be rebuilt at $250,000 this year, but he is trying to save the City money by waiting. Chief Pitchler stated that the directors save as much as they can because everyone is aware of the financial situation of the City.

Mr. Sims commended Chief Pitchler for explaining the situation with his vehicles and appreciated Mr. Consolo’s comments to watch expenditures in the budget. Mr. Sims stated that he supports the expenditure because he does not believe a different vehicle would be appropriate for the use that it is intended. He noted that the Durango is well beyond its useful life and should be decommissioned. Mr. Sims mentioned that he asked for an inventory of vehicles to determine that there is not excessive amount of vehicle sitting around the city not in use and without purpose. Mr. Sims stated that Chief Pitcher made a good case to the Safety Committee and as long as the City is going to function, the Council must continue to consider equipping the departments in a way that it can continue to provide appropriate service to the residents.

Mr. Bernardo inquired if it is possible to put away money from the rescue squad runs. Mr. Ochoa noted that of the $200,000 received per year approximately $80,000 goes to the joint dispatch. He noted that he puts money away for Fire, then other requests will come in from the Police Department and the Building Department to also put money away from funds those departments bring in.

Mr. Ochoa stated that by keeping all the monies in the General Fund, it can be used for purposes of all departments as their needs require. Mayor Rothschild stated that University Heights is doing good because it is not a City with great commerce so the City carries over as much as it can each year to do what it can. She noted that there is always room for improvement, but the City is doing a good job with its current resources.

Chief of Police Gary Stehlik stated that the department has increased its training and equipment turn out for rapid response in emergency situations. He noted that last year he requested an Expedition and was asked to scale the vehicle back to a Jeep Grand Cherokee, which has not met the needs of the department because it is too small and under powered because the equipment drains the battery.

Chief Stehlik requested the purchase of the 2008 Chevrolet Tahoe this year which is built for the functions the department needs to provide. He noted that the Tahoe will carry HAZMAT suits, body bunker armor, high powered weapons and other equipment such as blanket, flares, video systems and fire extinguishers. Chief Stehlik stated that the other 4-wheel drive equipment vehicle will remain in service and the one 4-wheel vehicle has been relegated to the supervisor on patrol, which serves the function of a regular car.

Vice Mayor Zucker inquired if the person had been answered who emailed the Council members regarding the purchase of the aforementioned vehicles. Mr. Bullock read Michelle Little’s email, dated April 9, 2008, into the record and stated that he has not responded, but will call her to invite her to meet with him and the chiefs regarding the vehicles, and he also intends to invite her to the next Safety Committee meeting. Ms. Little was concerned about global warming, conserving energy and the high cost of gasoline. Chief Stehlik pointed out that the gas mileage in the city is almost the same as the Crown Victoria cruisers. He added where mileage suffers is highway miles, which they don’t expect to have much of. Chief Stehlik stated that the Tahoe also comes in flex fuel, but the cost of the vehicle is more expensive and the mileage is higher.

Mr. Consolo stated that his concern has nothing to do global warming. He inquired if the four Jeep Grand Cherokee purchased last year for the Police Department are still in service. Chief Stehlik replied that they are all still in service and that they are all 6-cylinder vehicles.

MOTION BY MR. BULLOCK, SECONDED BY MRS. ZUCKER to approve the passage of Ordinance No. 2008-15 as an emergency measure. On roll call, on suspension of rules, all voted “aye,” except Mr. Consolo, who voted “nay.” On roll call, on passage, all voted “aye,” except Mr. Consolo, who voted “nay.”

G. Ordinance No. 2008-16 Authorizing the purchase of two 2008 Ford Crown Victorias for the Police Department through the State Purchasing Program

Ordinance No. 2008-16 authorizing the purchase of two 2008 Ford Crown Victorias (P71) for the Police Department through the Ohio Cooperative Purchasing Program from Statewide Ford in Van Wert, Ohio in an amount not to exceed $45,348.
Mr. Bullock stated that the Council has received a list of all vehicles owned by the City by department. Mr. Ochoa noted that the Building Department vehicles were purchased in 2001 and each has around 14,000 miles on them.

Chief Stehlik commented on the succession of vehicles in the Police Department. He noted that the Jeeps and administrator cars are cycled around the department to get the most of mileage and years of service. Once they have completed service for the Police Department, they are evaluated and the best two are transferred to the Service Department to use as utility vehicles. Chief Stehlik noted that the Crown Victorias are mainly used as patrol cars and when the useful life is expended, they are sold by sealed bid. He noted vehicles are constantly being replaced, normally at a level of two per year. Chief Stehlik noted, however, that there were two or three years where funds were not available for cars and now the last two years they have been trying to catch up and get the fleet back up to standards.

Mr. Consolo inquired how many cruisers are on the streets per shift. Chief Stehlik replied that there are three to five cruisers depending who is on shift and a couple of detective cars. In referring to his vehicle inventory list, Chief Stehlik reported that the two new Crown Victorias will replace units 7232 and 7237 and the Tahoe will replace unit 7237 the patrol/SWAT car.

Mr. Murphy noted that the requested vehicles are safety vehicles and added that the City should look elsewhere to make potential cuts.

**MOTION BY MR. BULLOCK, SECONDED BY MR. MURPHY** to approve the passage of Ordinance No. 2008-16 as an emergency measure. On roll call, on suspension of rules, all voted “aye,” except Mr. Consolo, who voted “nay.” On roll call, on passage, all voted “aye,” except Mr. Consolo, who voted “nay.”

**II. Motion authorizing the purchase of a paint striping machine for the Police Department**

Chief Stehlik reported that the paint striping machine is used for all street striping and crosswalks in the city. He noted that the current machine was purchased in 1995 and needs to be replaced because the machine does not work properly. He also noted that if the paint striping work was contracted out, it would cost approximately $5,000 per year just for the line striping of the main streets of Cedar Road, S. Belvoir Blvd., Warrensville Center Road, and S. Green Road. He noted that the machine will pay for itself over time.

Chief Stehlik reported that three quotes were received. The lowest bid was received from Sherwin Williams in the amount of $9,992.99. Chief Stehlik recommended that the paint striping machine be purchased from Sherwin Williams.

Mr. Consolo inquired if they have considered sharing a striping machine with another city. Chief Stehlik replied that all cities are busy painting their own streets during the summer painting season (May through September).

**MOTION BY MR. BULLOCK, SECONDED BY MR. SIMS** to authorize the purchase of a paint striping machine for the Police Department from Sherwin Williams in an amount not to exceed $9,992.99. On roll call, all voted “aye.”

Mr. Bullock noted that the Chief will be looking into a different type of paint which may last longer. A report on this will be presented at a later date. Mr. Bullock stated that as long as he is chairman of the Safety Committee and a member of City Council, they will do what has to be done to make sure that the city is safe, and that the citizens are safe, and that children crossing the streets are safe, and that the Fire and Police Departments are equipped as best as possible to do the job that is expected of them. He added that all this will be done while being as efficient as possible and controlling costs to the best of Council’s ability.

**I. Motion to hold an executive session immediately following this regular meeting for the purpose of discussing personnel, litigation and real estate matters**

**MOTION BY MRS. ZUCKER, SECONDED BY MR. BULLOCK** to hold an executive session for the purpose of discussing the possible purchase of real estate. On roll call, all voted “aye.”

**Directors’ Reports:**

**Finance Director** Arman Ochoa reported that the Municipal Finance Officers Association will meet on May 14, 2008 at Night Town in Cleveland Heights. He noted that the Susan Cave, Exec. Director, Ohio Municipal League, will be present at the meeting to discuss the state of Ohio and pending legislation.
Mayor Rothschild reported that the Cuyahoga County Mayors and Managers is looking into the Cuyahoga County Election Board’s discount that they removed from the cities taxes to pay for the new election board’s voting equipment. They have requested the rational behind why they did it and what it was based on. Mayor Rothschild will pass the information on when it is received.

Building Commissioner William Nadeau reported that permits have been issued on the parking garage at University Square and the work to be done is commencing.

Committee Reports:

Building Committee Chairman Peter R. Bernardo reported that he will schedule a meeting within the next couple weeks.

Civic Information Chairman Frank Consolo reported that the Loyola Group is working on the RFP for website maintenance and updating and should have something for the committee to review within the next couple weeks.

Finance Committee Chairman Steven Sims reported that the Finance Committee will meet on Thursday, April 24, 2008 at 7:00 p.m. in Council Chambers to start an initial discussion on a Debt Policy for the City. He noted that Mr. Jeff Rink of KeyBank has been invited to attend to provide foundational information.

Service and Utilities Committee Chair Adele H. Zucker reported that she is attempting to arrange a committee meeting. An agenda and background data will be presented once the meeting is scheduled. Ms. Zucker noted that the Service Department will be requesting equipment also.

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was recessed into an executive session. Following the executive session, the meeting was adjourned.

Mayor Beryl E. Rothschild

Nancy E. English, Clerk of Council